



For a Strong Parliament, for not Repeating the Mistakes

An Evaluation of Kurdistan Parliament's Fourth Term Activities

6/11/2013- 6/11/2018

The Thirteenth Report



NED
National Endowment for Democracy



PAY INSTITUTE
For Education & Development

For a strong parliament, in order not to repeat the mistakes

Project Staff

Project Supervisor:
Dr. Sarwar Abdulrahman
Omar

Project Manager
Baban Jaafar Hama

Project Coordinator:
Aram Sardar Omar

PAY Observatory website
director:
Arez Dara Hafeed

PAY Observatory website
Arabic section manager:
Meeran Husain Hasan

Project Accountant:
Rwanga Fayaq

Contributors in writing the
reports:
Dr. Sakar Azeez Rasheed

Translation:
Ranj Faraidun Abdulrahman

An Assessment for the Works of the fourth term Of Kurdistan Parliament

(November 6th, 2013 until November 6th, 2018)

Report Thirteenth

PAY Institute for Education and Development is a Kurdistan-based non-governmental organization that was formally registered at the non-governmental organizations department on (28/11/2013), and began its activities in December 2013.

Monitoring the Kurdistan Parliament Project:

This project started to perform its work with the beginning of the 4th term of the Kurdistan Parliament. And now, with the support of the National Endowment for Democracy (NED), it implements this project.



PAY INSTITUTE
For Education & Development

- ههوائی پۆژانهی پەرلهمان
- پەرلهمانی کوردستان له میدیاکاندا
- ئینفۆگرافیک
- پهیرهوی ناوخۆی پەرلهمان
- بهترامهی کاری پەرلهمان
- پاڤۆتهکانی پڕۆژهی چاودێری پەرلهمان
- ئامادهبوونی ئهئامانای پەرلهمان
- پلاوکراره دهریارهی کاری پەرلهمانی
- پلاوکرارهکانی پەرلهمانی کوردستان
- پهیرهوئینگیهه به ئهئامانای پەرلهمانهوه
- بیرۆا
- دهستۆری ههژمهی کوردستان
- دهستۆری عێراق

ههوائی پۆژانهی پەرلهمان



ریفینگ هرووی بانگیشتی پەرلهمانتاران بۆ دانیشتنی دهکات (18)



وردهکاری دانیشتنی تهمرۆی فراکسیونهکان



پڕۆژههک بۆ راگرتنی پهیرهوی نوێی ناوخۆی پەرلهمان پزێشکesh دهکرت



دوو کاندیدیاد تر له شوێنی قوباد تالهانی و شاسوار عهبدولواحید سوێند دهخۆن



لهسهه سکاڵای نهوهی نوێ سهرۆکی کاتیی پەرلهمانی بانگوینستی دادگا کرا



گفتوگۆیهکی یاسایی سهبارهت به پهیرهوی ناوخۆی پەرلهمانی کوردستان

بیرۆا لهسهه پەرلهمان

- له ئێوان سههژیککی لاواز و پەرلهمانتکی خهسێتره 18, 2019
- پەرلهمانتارو نهبوونی ئیمل 31st, 2019
- بیرارهکانی پهگهه دانیشتنی کاپههی ئۆیهه، پزسیار و سه رنج 18th, 2019
- نۆزه خهکگ و هاواری حزب! 13th, 2019
- کارنامهی حکومه تهگهی مهسروور بارزانی و نهزموونی ولاتان 12th, 2019

PAY Institute for Education and Development
 Address: Sulaymaniyah – Salim Street – Shamer Building / Phone: 07701564576 - 07701465733
 E-mail: sarwary74@yahoo.com - payinstitute@gmail.com Facebook: facebook.com/pay-institute Website: www.payied.org

Copyright © Pay Institute for Education and Development - 2017 Pay Institute holds a license from NGO Department - No. 1406 dated 26 November 2013

All Copy Rights of this report is reserved for PAY Institute for Education and Development



Contents

| | |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
| Conducting the election for the fourth term of Kurdistan Parliament | |
| Table number (1): List of political parties and their total votes in the fourth term elections 2013 | |
| Table number (2): The Kurdistan Parliament in terms of the age of its members | |
| Table number (3): The Kurdistan Parliament in terms of gender balance | |
| Table number (4): The Kurdistan Parliament in terms of the ethnicity of its members | |
| Table number (5): The Kurdistan Parliament in terms of the academic level and achievements of its members | |
| Table number (6): The Kurdistan Parliament in terms of the religion of its members | |
| Table number (7): Kurdistan Parliament in terms of number of representatives per governorate | |
| Table number (8): The Parliament members in terms of representing the governorates | |
| The First meeting of the fourth term and the election of the Presidium | |
| The Parliaments Committees | |
| First: The Permanent Committees | |
| Second: The Temporary Committees | |
| The Bills and decisions that were presented and read during the fourth term, table number (9) | |
| The Bills that were passed during the fourth term of the parliament | |
| The decisions that were approved during the fourth term of the parliament | |
| Recommendations | |
| The Kurdistan Parliament's Rules of Procedure | |
| Table number (10): the level of implementing the laws and decisions of the fourth term of the Kurdistan Parliament | |
| Table number (11): the type of the bills that were passed during the fourth term of the parliament | |
| Table number (11): the passed and rejected bills during the fourth term of the parliament | |
| Budget in the Parliament | |
| First: The budget bill | |
| Second: Final Accounts | |
| The Parliament and monitoring the executive power | |
| Table number (13): The sittings of the Parliament | |
| Disabling the Parliament and preventing its speaker from going to the Parliament | |
| First: the stage before preventing the Parliament's speaker | |
| Second: the stage of reactivating the Parliament | |
| The Parliament and preparing the Constitution Bill | |
| Table number (12): The Members of the Parliament who didn't finish the fourth term and the reasons, | |
| The violations against the Parliament | |
| The violations and mistakes committed by the Parliament | |
| Conclusion | |
| Table number (14): a summary of the Parliament's works during the five years of its fourth term | |
| The publications of PAY Institute for Education and Development | |

Pay Observatory to monitor the Kurdistan Parliament

www.pavied.org

The (PAY Observatory) is the website for (PAY Institute) and it's specific to monitoring the Kurdistan Parliament, it's been working for four years, and it is a part of the project of monitoring and evaluating the work of the Kurdistan Parliament. This website publishes information about the previous three terms of the Kurdistan Parliament in both Kurdish and Arabic languages, including (the curriculum vitae of the members of the Parliament and the presidency board, the laws, decisions, the permanent and temporary committees etc.)

As for the fourth session (2013 - 2018), it published the curriculum vitae of the members of the parliament, the presidency of the parliament, the laws and decisions issued by the parliament and the temporary and permanent committees. And Program work of the sessions, rules of procedure, video clips of all parliamentary sessions, news related to parliament, absentee of members of parliament during the session, list of phone numbers of members of parliament, as well as other sections such as published topics on parliament in other media and information about the parliament in the info graphic, and a publication on the parliamentary work and publications of the parliament and free writing on parliament, as well as interest in the news of parliamentary committees and blocs provided that they are related to the issuance of laws and monitoring public institutions.

The (PAY Observatory) website also published all the Parliamentary Oversight Project reports and all other projects worked on by the PAY Institute. After the completion of work in the Arabic section of the site will be working in the future to add the English language section for the website. Now, With the beginning of the fifth parliamentary term, the parliamentary supervision project continues, and many changes have been made to the project.

Introduction

PAY Institute for Education and Development is a Kurdish Non-Governmental Organization, which was officially registered in the NGOs Office on November 26th, 2013 and started its activities in December of the same year. One of its works has been monitoring the performance of the public institutions, within the frame of this work, one of the establishments that the observatory has been monitoring during the last five years was Kurdistan Parliament, in cooperation with the American organization National Fund to support democracy (NED).

During these five years we were able to publish 12 reports about the parliament, our aim in this was to make sure that this national institution carries out its tasks and works and is at the level of trust the Kurdish nation had in it, to have a main and crucial role in solving the issues and crises, prevent it from being violated and not to allow the political parties to hinder its works and disable it anymore, since having a strong parliament which passes suitable laws and closely monitors the executive power is a main reason for the society to be developed and institutionalized. We believe that our monitoring alongside other civil society organizations' monitoring will be a strong support to parliament's success.

In all the reports necessary information and data was collected, the parliament's sessions, protocols and website were observed, and for the same reason we visited the presidency, the committees and the blocs. The first report was published on November 6th, 2014, and this is the thirteenth report about the works of the parliament, which is a general assessment for the five-year duration of the fourth term of the parliament, and it's about showing the mistakes, shortcomings, problems and challenges of the previous term hoping that the parliament will benefit from it for the fifth term, the good aspects will be developed, and the violations will be stopped and not happen again.

During the course of its work, the project has been through some ups and downs, in the beginning many of the parties, blocs, the presidency and even many of the parliament members did not agree with us and didn't have a positive view about the project, they later realized that the aim of the project is a just civil work to help developing the work of the parliament and the principles of democracy, and that PAY Institute writes the reports in an unbiased way, and the majority of the members of the parliament and the presidency board wholeheartedly welcomed the project.

During other stages of the work, our teams were prevented from working and information was not shared with us, despite all of that we didn't stop the project and continued publishing new reports.

Believing in (Monitoring and Assessment) principle is the best way to developing institutions, making use of the Kurdistan Region Laws which include (the Non-Governmental Organizations Law, the Right to gain information Law, the Joint Charter and Development between Public Institutions and Non-Governmental Organizations), PAY Institute continues its works and will continue the same project during the fifth term with the assistance of Kurdistan Parliament and in partnership with the American organization National Fund to support democracy (NED), and we will publish our reports same as we have in the past, upload them to (PAY Observatory) website, and later for the purpose of informing the public,

the formal and informal centers inside and outside of the region we will publish our reports in both English and Arabic languages.

The aims of the project are: creating transparency in parliamentary work, creating a bridge to deliver information and data to the region's citizens, showing the parliament's performance as it is and lobbying so that the parliament takes its course, doesn't violate the rule of procedures and carry out its main tasks.

In a nutshell, the main aim of the project has been showing the true performance of the representatives to their voters, creating an environment where transparency is part of the parliamentary works and tasks, and telling the public how the main pillars of work, such as (legislation, monitoring and budget approval) are done in that national institution.

In PAY Institution, we want to support the members and the presidency of parliament by sharing clear and detailed information about the performance of that institution with the parties' voters, so that active members are differentiated from inactive members of parliament, and create a civil pressure on those parliament members who don't carry out their tasks as required. In other shorter words, the project aims at connecting the parliament members with the voters and strengthen the relation between the public the that national institution, so that parliament members carry out their tasks and the institution can carry out its monitoring and legislation tasks.

PAY Institute for Education and Development
August 29th, 2019

Holding the election for the fourth term of Kurdistan Parliament

On September 21st, 2013 the election process for the fourth term of Kurdistan parliament was held in the semi-open list system, 31 lists participated in the process and 17 lists succeeded. Despite all the frauds made during the election, the result of the election announced by the Iraqi Independent High Electoral Commission was as the following:

Table number (1)
Lists and blocs and their total votes
Fourth Term Election 2013

| List No. | Name of Blocs and Lists | Total Votes | No. of seats |
|----------|---------------------------------------------|-------------|--------------|
| 110 | Kurdistan Democratic Party List | 743984 | 38 |
| 117 | Change List | 476736 | 24 |
| 102 | Patriotic Union of Kurdistan List | 350500 | 18 |
| 105 | Kurdistan Islamic Union List | 186741 | 10 |
| 104 | Kurdistan Islamic group List | 118574 | 6 |
| 101 | Islamic Movement List | 21834 | 1 |
| 111 | Kurdistan Socialist Democratic Party List | 12501 | 1 |
| 107 | Freedom List | 12392 | 1 |
| 115 | Third Direction List | 8681 | 1 |
| 126 | Rafidain List | 6145 | 2 |
| 127 | Assyrian Syriac Chaldean Popular Group List | 5730 | 2 |
| 124 | Turkmen Development Party List | 5259 | 2 |
| 121 | Erbil Turkmen List | 1951 | 1 |
| 120 | Turkmen Reform Party List | 1926 | 1 |
| 122 | Turkmen Front List | 1753 | 1 |
| 125 | Abnaa'-Al-Nahrain List | 1093 | 1 |
| 131 | Armenian List | 531 | 1 |
| Total | | 1.956.331 | 111 |

Table number (2)
Age of the Members of Kurdistan Parliament

| No. | Birth Year | Fourth Term Election - 2013 | |
|-------|-------------|-----------------------------|------|
| | | number | % |
| 1- | 1940 - 1949 | 1 | 0.9 |
| 2- | 1950 - 1959 | 8 | 7.2 |
| 3- | 1960 - 1969 | 32 | 28.8 |
| 4- | 1970 - 1979 | 56 | 50.5 |
| 5- | 1980 - 1986 | 14 | 12.6 |
| Total | | 111 | 100 |

Table number (3)
Gender Balance in Kurdistan Parliament

| No. | Male and Female Members | Number of Parliament Members | Percentage |
|-------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|------------|
| 1 | Number of Male Parliament Members | 77 | 69.4 |
| 2 | Number of Female Parliament Members | 34 | 30.6 |
| Total | | 111 | 100% |

Table number (4)
Ethnicity in Kurdistan Parliament

| No. | Ethnicity | Number | Percentage |
|-------|--------------------------|--------|------------|
| 1 | Kurds | 100 | 90.1 |
| 2 | Turkmen | 5 | 4.5 |
| 3 | Chaldean Syriac Assyrian | 5 | 4.5 |
| 4 | Armenian | 1 | 0.9 |
| Total | | 111 | 100 |

Table number (5)
Kurdistan Parliament in terms of education level and academic achievement of its members

| No. | Education | Number | Percentage |
|-------|---------------|------------|------------|
| 1 | Ph. D | 19 | 17.1 |
| 2 | M.A | 11 | 9.9 |
| 3 | B. A | 52 | 46.8 |
| 4 | Dip. HE | - | - |
| 5 | Dip. | 11 | 9.9 |
| 6 | HSD. | 11 | 9.9 |
| 7 | Middle School | 7 | 6.3 |
| Total | | 111 | 100 |

Table number (6)
Kurdistan Parliament in terms of the religion of its members

| No. | Religion | Number | Percentage |
|-------|--------------|------------|------------|
| 1 | Islam | 104 | 93.7 |
| 2 | Christianity | 6 | 5.4 |
| 3 | Yazidi | 1 | 0.9 |
| Total | | 111 | 100 |

Table number (7)
Kurdistan Parliament in terms of number of representatives per governorate

| No. | Governorate | No. of seats | Percentage |
|-------|--------------|--------------|------------|
| 1 | Erbil | 30 | 27.0 |
| 2 | Sulaimaniyah | 48 | 44.1 |
| 3 | Dohuk | 33 | 28.8 |
| Total | | 111 | 100 |

Table number (8)
Kurdistan Parliament members in terms of governorate representatives from
different blocs in the fourth term elections - 2013

| No. | Bloc | Total No. of seats | Erbil | % | Sulaimaniyah | % | Dohuk | % | Total percentage |
|-----|---------------------------------------------|--------------------|-----------|-------|--------------|-------|-----------|-------|------------------|
| 1 | Kurdistan Democratic Party List | 38 | 10 | 26.3 | 3 | 7.9 | 25 | 65.8 | 100% |
| 2 | Gorran Movement List | 24 | 6 | 25.0 | 18 | 75.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 3 | Patriotic Union of Kurdistan List | 18 | 3 | 16.7 | 15 | 83.3 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 4 | Kurdistan Islamic Union List | 10 | 2 | 20.0 | 4 | 40.0 | 4 | 40.0 | 100% |
| 5 | Kurdistan Islamic group List | 6 | 2 | 33.3 | 4 | 66.7 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 6 | Islamic Movement List | 1 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 7 | Kurdistan Socialist Democratic Party List | 1 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 8 | Freedom List | 1 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 9 | Third Direction List | 1 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 10 | Rafidain List | 2 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 2 | 100.0 | 100% |
| 11 | Assyrian Syriac Chaldean Popular Group List | 2 | 1 | 50.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 50.0 | 100% |
| 12 | Turkmen Development Party List | 2 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 13 | Erbil Turkmen List | 1 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 14 | Turkmen Reform Party List | 1 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 15 | Turkmen front List | 1 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 16 | Abnaa'-Al-Nahrain List | 1 | 1 | 100.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 100% |
| 17 | Armenian List | 1 | 0 | 0.0 | 0 | 0.0 | 1 | 100.0 | 100% |
| | Total | 111 | 30 | | 48 | | 33 | | |

The First Meeting of the Fourth Term and electing the presidency

According to law, the fourth term of the parliament should've started before November 1st, 2013, in other words, before the end of the third term, but the meeting was delayed for six days, during which the Kurdistan Region was in a legal gap.

The first meeting of Kurdistan Parliament was on November 6th, 2013, which was held for purpose of swearing-in the members of parliament in the parliament hall. Based on Article 13 of the Rule of Procedures of the parliament the presidency must be elected in the same meeting,¹ but the election of the presidency didn't happen. The same violation happened again in the first meeting of the fifth parliamentary term on November 6th, 2018 after swearing-in the successful candidates.

One of the other illegal works in the fourth parliamentary term was that the presidency of the previous term (Arsalan Bayz – Speaker, Hasan Muhammad Sura – Deputy Speaker, Frsat Ahmed – Secretary) called for the meeting of the new term members, when the meeting was held, not only the previous presidency, the previous parliament was also invalid for a week.

Another violation was that in the meeting all the blocs signed an agreement among them to keep the meeting open, this was the beginning of all the parties agreeing on violating the law, and the rule of procedures, which they made it a custom and this violation was moved on to the fifth term where it was repeated.

The election of Kurdistan Parliament's Presidency

On April 29th, 2014, after 7 months and 9 days of the fourth term parliamentary election, and after 5 months and 21 days of swearing-in its members, the parliament held a meeting in which they elected the presidency, with the following results:

- 1- Dr. Yousuf Muhammad Sadiq – Speaker – Gorran Bloc – 84 votes
- 2- Jaafar Eminky – Deputy Speaker – Kurdistan Democratic Party Bloc – 79 votes.
- 3- Fakhraddeen Tahir – Secretary – Kurdistan Islamic Group Bloc – 73 votes.

However, on October 12th, 2015 when the speaker was prevented from entering Erbil, he was not able to go to parliament and the parliament was left without a speaker. The secretary also resigned from his position on September 30th, 2017. Later, on October 18th, 2017, Begard Dilshad was elected as the new secretary, and the until the end of the fourth term the parliament didn't have a speaker and sessions were run by the deputy speaker and the secretary.

In the first session of the fourth term, a kind of conflict and tension between the bloc of Kurdistan Patriotic Union with both blocs of Gorran Movement and Kurdistan Democratic Party was noticed, the same situation happened again in the fifth term when the Kurdistan Patriotic Union bloc didn't attend the meeting of February 18th, 2019 to elect the presidency of parliament.

¹ Article 13 of the parliament's rules of procedure:

1-The interim speaker, after being sworn-in, allows, for a period of time, nominations for the positions of speaker, the deputy speaker and the secretary of parliament.

2-After the end of that period, nominations will end and secret voting will be held and whoever gains the most votes will be vector.

The Parliamentary Committees

First: The Standing Committees:

In the fourth term the Kurdistan Parliament consisted of 22 different committees, as based on Article 37 of the Rules of Procedure talks about forming the committees and allows each member of parliament to be part of the committees based on their desire the area of expertise. Each committee should not have less than 5 members and not more than 11, the duty of the committees is to follow up with the projects and works of the government and go into the public to be aware of their problems.¹

- 1- Industry, Energy and Natural Resources Committee
- 2- Human Rights Committee
- 3- Committee of Peshmarga Affairs, Martyrs and Victims of Genocides
- 4- Civil Society Affairs Committee
- 5- Integrity Committee
- 6- Sports and Youth Committee
- 7- Municipal Services Committee
- 8- Endowments and Religious Affairs Committee
- 9- Relations, Culture and Media Committee
- 10- Committee for Social Affairs, Children and Family
- 11- Consumer Rights Committee
- 12- Health and Environment Affairs Committee
- 13- Committee for the Defense of Women's Rights
- 14- Finance and Economic Affairs Committee
- 15- Committee of Internal Affairs and Security
- 16- Legal Affairs Committee
- 17- Education and Higher Education Committee
- 18- Agriculture and Irrigation Committee
- 19- Committee for Reconstruction and Housing
- 20- Committee of Kurdistan areas outside the region
- 21- Parliamentary Affairs Committee
- 22- Committee on Relations and Affairs of Kurdistan Communities

¹ According to Kurdistan Parliament's resolution (4) issued on May 7th, 2014, the committees were formed and identified, which were 18 committees. Previously, according to resolution of Kurdistan Parliament, issued on May 4th, 2014, the legal committee was formed.

- During the formation of the committees, the members' professionalism was not considered as much as the political aspect was considered.
- The parliamentary committees were not carrying out their tasks as required in writing reports about the bills, which was a reason why the parliament was not able to hold its meetings, since the prepared bills were not made available with the reports to be put in the agenda.
- The total number of reports the committees were supposed to write was 495 reports, however, the committees during those five years only wrote 149 reports, and 346 reports were not written, while they were supposed to be written.
- The parliamentary committees didn't properly monitor the relevant ministries, subcommittees and offices, and monitoring was a weakness in the works.
- The parliamentary committees that were negligent in writing their reports about the bills were: (Legal Affairs Committee, Finance and Economic Affairs Committee, Committee of Internal Affairs and Security, Education and Higher Education Committee, Health and Environment Affairs Committee, Committee for Reconstruction and Housing, Relations, Culture and Media Committee, Committee of Peshmarga Affairs, Martyrs and Victims of Genocides, Human Rights Committee and Integrity Committee.)
- The parliamentary committees who performed the worst in carrying out their works were: (Committee for the Defense of Women's Rights, Committee on Relations and Affairs of Kurdistan Communities, Sports and Youth Committee, and Committee of Kurdistan areas outside the region).
- The parliamentary committees who had a decent performance in carrying out their works were: (Municipal Services Committee, Parliamentary Affairs Committee, Civil Society Affairs Committee, and Industry, Energy and Natural Resources Committee.)
- The parliamentary committees who had the best performance in carrying out their tasks and wrote their reports about all bills directed to them, were: (Agriculture and Irrigation Committee, Endowments and Religious Affairs Committee and Committee for Social Affairs, Children and Family.)

Second: the working (temporary) committees:

During the fourth parliamentary term several working committees were formed, such as:

- 1- An Investigation Committee to investigate the events happened in Sulaimaniyah and Erbil on April 30th, 2014 and the following days.¹
- 2- A committee to review the parliament's rules of procedure.²
- 3- A committee for the nomination of the members commissioners board.³
- 4- A committee to investigate and follow up with the recognition of crimes against the Kurdish population as Genocide.⁴
- 5- A committee to prepare the Kurdistan Region Constitution draft.⁵
- 6- A joint committee was formed from the members of both the (Integrity Committee) and the (Industry, Energy and Natural Resources Committee) for the purpose of following up with the cases of people accused of trading with the terrorist organization (ISIL), but the committee didn't achieve its objectives.

¹ Forming a committee based on resolution number 3 issued on May 4th, 2014 to investigate the events that happened on April 30th, 2014. This committee finished its works, wrote a report that was presented to the parliament, but the parliament didn't put the report into its agenda.

² Based on parliamentary resolution number 10 issued on June 16th, 2014, this committee consisted of 13 members. The committee finished its works, prepared the Rule of Procedures and the parliament approved it.

³ Based on parliamentary resolution number 21, issued on September 23rd, 2014, this committee was formed and consisted of 8 members. The committee finished its works (despite the comments on their work mechanism).

⁴ Based on parliamentary resolution number 22, issued on September 23rd, 2014. The committee was formed and had 11 members, which was specific to the genocide crime against the Yazidis in Shangal, but the committee didn't carry out any of its works, and was later canceled with a parliamentary resolution.

⁵ This Committee was not able to finish its works during the specified period (from May 25th, 2015 until August 28th, 2015) which was 90 days, it only prepared a draft for 74 constitutional articles. The committee asked for another 90 days to finish its works, but the parliament didn't approve the extension.

The Draft Laws and Resolutions That Were Submitted in the Fourth Term and Were Read Table No. 9

| No. | Name of law and resolution | Date of reading D/M/Y |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------|
| 1. | Draft law of the third amendment of law of presidency of Kurdistan region No. 1 of the year 2005 amended. | 7/5/2014 |
| 2. | Draft law of income box of oil and gas. | 7/5/2014 |
| 3. | Draft law of Kurdistan box of the income of oil products of Kurdistan region-Iraq by the council of minister. | 7/5/2014 |
| 4. | Draft law of honoring Peshmarga. | 7/5/2014 |
| 5. | Draft law of Kurdistan Company for discovering and producing oil. | 7/5/2014 |
| 6. | Draft law of amending the law of organizing protests in Kurdistan region No. 11 of the year 2011. | 7/5/2014 |
| 7. | Draft law of amending the law of organizing protests in Kurdistan region No. 11 of the year 2011. | 14/5/2014 |
| 8. | Draft law of amending the continuance of advanced payment and its effect on Kurdistan region's economy. | 7/5/2014 |
| 9. | Draft law of amending the law of investment No. 4 of the year 2006. | 7/5/2014 |
| 10. | Draft law of formal languages in Kurdistan region. | 14/5/2014 |
| 11. | Draft law of granting budgets to the political parties of Kurdistan region. | 14/5/2014 |
| 12. | Draft law of the independent commission of elections and referendum in Kurdistan region. | 14/5/2014 |
| 13. | Draft law of the higher independent commission of election and referendum in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 7/7/2014 |
| 14. | Draft law of peace capital in Kurdistan region and Iraq. | 14/5/2014 |
| 15. | Draft law of public prosecutor in Kurdistan region-Iraq -1- | 20/5/2014 |
| 16. | Draft law of public prosecutor in Kurdistan region-Iraq -2- | 20/5/2014 |
| 17. | Draft law of ending the implementation of fighting terrorism No. 3 of the year 2006 in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 20/5/2014 |
| 18. | Draft law of implementing the law of unified retirement in Iraq. | 20/5/2014 |
| 19. | Draft law of fighting corruption in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 20/5/2014 |
| 20. | Draft law of national commission for negotiation. | 20/5/2014 |
| 21. | Draft law of citizens' share in natural resources. | 20/5/2014 |
| 22. | Draft law of the third amendment of law of retirement of Kurdistan parliamentarians- Iraq No. 13 of the year 1999 amended. | 26/5/2014 |
| 23. | Draft law of preserving food. | 26/5/2014 |
| 24. | Draft law of amending salary. | 26/5/2014 |
| 25. | Draft law of organizing of planting and transporting of human body organs in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 26/5/2014 |
| 26. | Draft law of passing the federal law of inclusion No. 12 of the year 2006. | 26/5/2014 |
| 27. | Draft law of assisting unmarried women. | 26/5/2014 |
| 28. | Draft law of extending the implementation of law of terrorism. | 26/5/2014 |
| 29. | Draft law of box of salary and pension in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 26/5/2014 |
| 30. | Draft law of ending to work with resolution No. 55 of the year 2004 of Kurdistan parliament-Iraq. | 7/7/2014 |
| 31. | Draft law of health fund -1- | 7/7/2014 |

| | | |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 32. | Draft law of health fund -2- | 7/7/2014 |
| 33. | Draft law of council and establishment of negotiation affairs. | 7/7/2014 |
| 34. | Draft law of commission of construction and service of Kurdistan villages. | 7/7/2014 |
| 35. | Draft law of amending the law of funding box for cancer patients in Kurdistan region No. 11 of the year 2012. | 7/7/2014 |
| 36. | Draft law of agriculture fund in Kurdistan region. | 7/7/2014 |
| 37. | Draft resolution of Sinjar and its surroundings' genocide. | 3/9/2014 |
| 38. | Draft resolution of acknowledging the genocide of Sinjar disaster. | 3/9/2014 |
| 39. | Draft resolution of acknowledgment of the crimes against Kurd nation (Yezidi Kurds) as mass killing. | 3/9/2014 |
| 40. | Draft law of amending the Iraqi penal code No. 11 of the year 1969. | 3/9/2014 |
| 41. | Draft law of protection of rights of racial, religious and doctrine components in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 3/9/2014 |
| 42. | Draft law of organizing the rights of Kurdistan region components. | 23/9/2014 |
| 43. | Draft law of education and study. | 3/9/2014 |
| 44. | Draft law of education in Kurdistan region. | 23/9/2014 |
| 45. | Draft law of education and learning in Kurdistan region. | 9/3/2015 |
| 46. | Draft law of amending the rules of procedure in Kurdistan parliament - | 23/9/2014 |
| 47. | Draft law of first amendment of law of the general commission of integrity in Kurdistan region-Iraq No. 3 of the year 2011. | 22/10/2014 |
| 48. | Draft law of social supervision and assistance. | 22/10/2014 |
| 49. | Draft law of social fund for homemaker women in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 20/5/2014 |
| 50. | Draft law of supervising the elderly in Kurdistan region-Iraq -1- | 26/5/2014 |
| 51. | Draft law of supervising the elderly in Kurdistan region-Iraq -2- | 26/5/2014 |
| 52. | Draft law of supervising the minors amended No. 78 of the year 1980. | 7/7/2014 |
| 53. | Draft law of social fund for orphaned children. | 7/7/2014 |
| 54. | Draft law of dwarfs in Kurdistan region. | 7/7/2014 |
| 55. | Draft law of social insurance in Kurdistan region-Iraq | 24/12/2014 |
| 56. | Draft law of general lines of social security in Kurdistan region. | 31/12/2014 |
| 57. | Draft law of Iraqi penal code No. 111 of the year 1969 -1- | 22/10/2014 |
| 58. | Draft law of amending the Iraqi penal code No. 111 of the year 1969 -2- | 22/10/2014 |
| 59. | Draft law of amending the law of fighting prostitution No. 8 of the year 1988 Iraqi. | 22/10/2014 |
| 60. | Draft law of fighting prostitution. | 22/10/2014 |
| 61. | Draft law of general pardon in Kurdistan region-Iraq -1- | 22/10/2014 |
| 62. | Draft law of general pardon in Kurdistan region-Iraq -2- | 22/10/2014 |
| 63. | Draft law of amending the law of governorates of Kurdistan region No. 3 of the year 2009. | 22/10/2014 |
| 64. | Draft law of legal authorization. | 22/10/2014 |
| 65. | Draft law of (the fundamental law of Kurdistan Red Crescent Society). | 22/10/2014 |
| 66. | Draft resolution of development of the governorate of Zakho in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 22/10/2014 |
| 67. | Draft resolution of valuation of employees upon the quorum of parliamentarians according to article 71 of rules of procedure of parliament No. 1 amended of the year 1992 of Kurdistan parliament-Iraq. | 10/11/2014 |
| 68. | Draft law of first amendment of law of ministry of higher education and scientific research No. 10 of the year 2008 according to article 71 of rules of | 10/11/2014 |

| | | |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| | procedure of parliament No. 1 amended of the year 1992 of Kurdistan parliament-Iraq. | |
| 69. | Draft law of withdrawing balance via borrowing in Kurdistan region-Iraq sent by the council of ministers. | 19/11/2014 |
| 70. | Draft law of first amendment of investment in Kurdistan region-Iraq No. 4 of the year 2006 | 19/11/2014 |
| 71. | Draft law of Kurdistan Company for discovering and producing oil in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 24/11/2014 |
| 72. | Draft law of amending the law of managing the municipalities in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 3/12/2014 |
| 73. | Draft law of rights and privileges of Mine Affairs staff in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 3/12/2014 |
| 74. | Draft law of amending the law of council of ministers in Kurdistan region No. 3 of the year 1992 amended. By the council of ministers. | 3/12/2014 |
| 75. | Draft law of prohibiting the deployment of two or more Peshmarga in the same family to war front. | 3/12/2014 |
| 76. | Draft law of fighting the smuggling of oil and its products. | 9/12/2014 |
| 77. | Draft law of passing and amending the law of fighting the smuggling of oil and its products No. 41 of the year 2008 of Iraqi house of representatives. | 9/12/2014 |
| 78. | Draft law of amending the law No. 22 of the year 2011 law of rights and privileges of the disabled and the special needs in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 9/12/2014 |
| 79. | Draft law of first amendment of supervising the disabled and special needs No. 22 of the year 2011. | 16/12/2014 |
| 80. | Draft law of national anthem of Kurdistan region-Iraq -1- | 9/12/2014 |
| 81. | Draft law of national anthem (Ay Raqib). -2- | 9/12/2014 |
| 82. | Draft law of improving the wellbeing of Peshmarga. | 9/12/2014 |
| 83. | Draft law of preparing the draft constitution of Kurdistan region-Iraq for the referendum. | 16/12/2014 |
| 84. | Draft law of rights and privileges of Peshmarga and the martyrs' family. | 16/12/2014 |
| 85. | Draft law of pardoning the Peshmarga and internal forces to pay back advanced payments of housing and marriage | 16/12/2014 |
| 86. | Draft resolution of counting one year of service to the Peshmarga and the officers at war. | 16/12/2014 |
| 87. | Draft law of amending the service and retirement of internal forces No. 18 of the year 2011. | 16/12/2014 |
| 88. | Draft law of third amendment of law No. 9 of the year 2007 of law of rights and privileges of martyrs' and Anfal family. | 16/12/2014 |
| 89. | Draft law of managing the conserving water in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 16/12/2014 |
| 90. | Draft law of member of supervision in Kurdistan parliament. | 16/12/2014 |
| 91. | Draft law of confidentiality of documents in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 16/12/2014 |
| 92. | Draft law of center of preserving the scriptures in Kurdistan. | 16/12/2014 |
| 93. | Draft law of agriculture fund. | 16/12/2014 |
| 94. | Draft law of first amendment of law No. 4 of the year 2014, law of higher independent commission of election and referendum. | 18/12/2014 |
| 95. | Draft law of amending the law of retirement of disabled Peshmarga (Zeravany of Kurdistan region-Iraq) No. 34 of the year 2007. | 18/12/2014 |
| 96. | Draft law of commission of migration and emigrants in the region. | 18/12/2014 |
| 97. | Draft law of amending the law of servitude and retirement of forces of internal security No. 18 of the year 2011. | 18/12/2014 |
| 98. | Draft law of first amendment of law No. 2 of the year 2013, law of private universities in Kurdistan region. | 24/12/2014 |
| 99. | Draft law of first amendment of law No. 2 of the year 2013, law of private universities in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 24/12/2014 |

| | | |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 100. | Draft law of pardoning the Peshmarga and Asaysh of paying back the advanced payment of marriage and housing. | 24/12/2014 |
| 101. | Draft resolution of pardoning the martyrs, Peshmarga and internal forces of paying back the advanced payment of housing and marriage. | 24/12/2014 |
| 102. | Draft resolution of keeping one salary for those whom have more than one salary. | 24/12/2014 |
| 103. | Draft resolution of protecting the sovereignty of Kurdistan-Iraq. | 24/12/2014 |
| 104. | Draft resolution of evacuation and handing back the buildings that belong to the government, to the government. | 31/12/2014 |
| 105. | Draft law of amending the law No. 13 of the year 2001 of law of box of pension of journalism in Kurdistan-Iraq. | 31/12/2014 |
| 106. | Draft law of first amending the law of justice authority No. 23 of the year 2007. | 31/12/2014 |
| 107. | Draft law of amending the law of narcotics No. 68 of the year 1965 amended. | 31/12/2014 |
| 108. | Draft resolution of position ranking and employing the graduates of political sciences. | 31/12/2014 |
| 109. | Draft resolution of position ranking for the graduates of political sciences and international relations. | 31/12/2014 |
| 110. | Draft law of first amendment of law of justice authority No. 23 of the year 2007. | 31/12/2014 |
| 111. | Draft law of general commission of safety and good quality of local and imported products in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 31/12/2014 |
| 112. | Draft law of protection the union of nation and land of Kurdistan-Iraq. | 31/12/2014 |
| 113. | Draft law of establishing dental clinics in basic schools. | 31/12/2014 |
| 114. | Draft law of third amendment of law of attorneys No. 17 of the year 1999. | 31/12/2014 |
| 115. | Draft resolution of amending the special ranks from the three presidencies of parliament, council of ministers and Kurdistan region and their departments. | 31/12/2014 |
| 116. | Draft law of management of Halabja governorate in Kurdistan region-Iraq | 27/1/2015 |
| 117. | Draft resolution of electing the district commissioner and the manager of sub districts in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 5/2/2015 |
| 118. | Draft law of public prosecutor in Kurdistan region. | 9/3/2015 |
| 119. | Draft law of separating the public and private sectors in the health system in Kurdistan region. | 9/3/2015 |
| 120. | Draft law of amending the salary. | 9/3/2015 |
| 121. | Draft law of amending the salaries in Kurdistan region-Iraq | 9/3/2015 |
| 122. | Draft law of amending the law No. 4 of the year 2006 of law of investment in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 9/3/2015 |
| 123. | Draft law of preventing of exceeding. | 9/3/2015 |
| 124. | Draft resolution of transforming Koya city to governorate in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 1/4/2015 |
| 125. | Draft resolution of compensating the martyrs and injuries of protestors of 17/Aug/2011 and the later days. | 1/4/2015 |
| 126. | Draft resolution of naming Ranya city as the capital of freedom. | 7/4/2015 |
| 127. | Draft resolution of transforming Garmyan management into governorate. | 7/4/2015 |
| 128. | Draft law of passing and amending the law of importation and sale of oil products No. 9 of the year 2006 in Kurdistan region. | 21/4/2015 |
| 129. | Draft law of Kurdistan Company for refining oil and its products KODO. | 21/4/2015 |
| 130. | Draft amendment of law of civil status No. 188 of the year 1959 in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 21/4/2015 |
| 131. | Draft law of compensating the affected people of compulsory displacement of populations of borderline zones in Kurdistan region. | 21/4/2015 |

| | | |
|------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 132. | Draft law of protecting the patients, medical doctors and staff. | 21/4/2015 |
| 133. | Draft resolution of assigning the date of 3/Aug/2014 as the date of Sinjar Genocide. | 21/4/2015 |
| 134. | Draft resolution of refugees and the deported. | 21/4/2015 |
| 135. | Draft law of fighting the human trafficking in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 29/4/2015 |
| 136. | Draft law of avoiding the degradation of religions in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 29/4/2015 |
| 137. | Draft law of suspending the implementation of renting houses No. 9 of the year 2008 in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 29/4/2015 |
| 138. | Draft law of reviewing and organizing the civilian and military retirement. | 20/5/2015 |
| 139. | Draft law of passing and amending the law of trading with smuggled and prohibited items in the local markets No. 18 of the year 2008 amended, of Federal Iraq. | 20/5/2015 |
| 140. | Draft law of amending the implementation of law of Iraq No. 45 of the year 1980. | 20/5/2015 |
| 141. | Draft law of second amendment of law No. 3 of the year 1998 of removing and sorting of lands inside the municipality limit. | 20/5/2015 |
| 142. | Draft law of first amendment of law No. 19 of the year 2007 of law of ministry of Peshmarga. | 20/5/2015 |
| 143. | Draft law of providing residential units for the Peshmarga that are in war against ISIS and do not own any residential units. | 20/5/2015 |
| 144. | Draft law of who are the sole survivors of chemical attack, Anfal and genocide. | 9/6/2015 |
| 145. | Draft law of keeping the salary of the sole survivors. | 9/6/2015 |
| 146. | Draft law of first amendment of law of formal languages, No. 6 of the year 2014. | 9/6/2015 |
| 147. | Draft law of prohibiting attitudes and behavioral violations that go against the moral and ethics of medical and health profession in Kurdistan region-Iraq. | 22/6/2015 |
| 148. | Draft law of amending the law of presidency of Kurdistan region of Iraq, No. 1 of the year 2005. | 22/6/2015 |
| 149. | Draft law of fourth amendment the law of presidency of Kurdistan region of Iraq, No. 1 of the year 2005. | 22/6/2015 |
| 150. | Draft law of fourth amendment the law of presidency of Kurdistan region of Iraq, No. 1 of the year 2005. | 22/6/2015 |
| 151. | Draft law of fourth amendment the law of presidency of Kurdistan region of Iraq, No. 1 of the year 2005. | 22/6/2015 |
| 152. | Draft law of implementing the law of civil affairs No. 65 of the year 1972 amended. | 22/6/2015 |
| 153. | Draft law of third amendment of law of attorneys in Kurdistan region-Iraq No 17 of the year 1999. | 30/6/2015 |
| 154. | Draft law of third amendment of law of box of lawyers' pension No. 18 of the year 1999. | 30/6/2015 |
| 155. | Draft law of attorneys in Kurdistan region. | 30/6/2015 |
| 156. | The draft bill of suspending the law of rents | 23/9/2017 |
| 157. | Draft law on terrorism | 23/9/2017 |
| 158. | Draft law for the continuation of the fourth round of the Parliament of Kurdistan Region | 18/10/2017 |
| 159. | Draft law on the distribution of powers of the Presidency of the region to public institutions in accordance with Article 71 of the Rules of Procedure of Parliament No. 1 of 1992, as amended | 29/10/2017 |
| 160. | Draft Resolution abolishing the compulsory savings of the salaries of the employees in the region | 30/9/2017 |
| 161. | Draft law of the second amendment to the application of the law of rents No. (87) for the year 1979 amended in Kurdistan region | 15/11/2017 |

| | | |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 162. | The draft amnesty(pardoning) law in Kurdistan region | 15/11/2017 |
| 163. | The second amendment to the law of the rents in real estate No. (87) For the year 1979 amended in the region. | 15/11/2017 |
| 164. | The draft amnesty law in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 15/11/2017 |
| 165. | Draft law amending the Traffic Law No. 86 of 2004 in Kurdistan Region | 6/12/2017 |
| 166. | Draft law of the Council of nationalities in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 6/12/2017 |
| 167. | Draft law of the Special Medical Units in Kurdistan Region of Iraq | 6/12/2017 |
| 168. | Draft law amending the fines in the Iraqi Penal Code No. (111) for the year 1992. | 6/12/2017 |
| 169. | Draft law of the medical council in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 6/12/2017 |
| 170. | Bill of the twentieth amendment to the law of the owners No. (20) For the year 1960 amended. | 6/12/2017 |
| 171. | Draft Law on trespassing State Property | 6/12/2017 |
| 172. | Draft law amending the law against domestic violence No. (8) for the year 2011 in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 6/12/2017 |
| 173. | Draft resolution not to consider the day (6/1) a public holiday coinciding with the establishment of the Iraqi army | 17/12/2017 |
| 174. | Draft resolution on occasions of Turkmen nationalities | 17/12/2017 |
| 175. | The decision to develop electronic cards for employees of the region | 17/12/2017 |
| 176. | Decision on reforms to be made in the register of those who receive salaries | 17/12/2017 |
| 177. | The decision to confiscate and return property and wealth that was obtained illegally | 17/12/2017 |
| 178. | The bill of reform in retirement, salaries, privileges, grants and allowances in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 10/1/2018 |
| 179. | Draft law on the transfer of armed forces to regular forces in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 10/1/2018 |
| 180. | Bill on the activation of the law against trafficking in human beings No. (28) for the year 2012 in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 10/1/2018 |
| 181. | Draft law for the reconstruction of villages in Kurdistan region | 10/1/2018 |
| 182. | Implementation of the law of preservation of documents - for the year 2016 in Kurdistan region | 10/1/2018 |
| 183. | The project of activating the law of those who lost part of their bodies due to the practices of the former regime (No. 5 of 2009) in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 10/1/2018 |
| 184. | The activation project (electronic signature law and electronic transactions No. (78) for the year (2012) in Kurdistan region | 10/1/2018 |
| 185. | Draft Law No. (39) for the year 2015 in the Kurdistan Region | 10/1/2018 |
| 186. | Draft resolution on the phenomenon of control of public land under the pretext of the establishment of orchards | 10/1/2018 |
| 187. | A draft resolution on what is happening in the district of Tuzkhurmatu and the areas outside the region as crimes against humanity | 10/1/2018 |
| 188. | Draft resolution to establish a temporary committee for investigating the exposure of Kurdish citizens in the district of Tuzkurmatu and other areas outside Kurdistan region as genocide by the Iraqi army after the events 2017/10/16 | 10/1/2018 |
| 189. | Draft law to protect water and sewage networks in Kurdistan region of Iraq | 30/1/2018 |
| 190. | Draft law on the representation of women in the institutions of Kurdistan region | 6/2/2018 |
| 191. | The bill to organize and unite Grand market of vegetable and fruit | 6/2/2018 |
| 192. | Bill of activation of the inclusion law No. (31) for the year 2015 in Kurdistan Region | 26/6/2018 |
| 193. | Bill of the Syrian Academy of Sciences in Kurdistan Region | 26/6/2018 |

| | | |
|------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------|
| 194. | Bill of activation, amendment and application the anti - human trafficking law No. (28) of 2012 in Iraq in Kurdistan Region | 26/6/2018 |
| 195. | Bill of first amendment of Law No. (2) of 2017 on the distribution of the powers of the presidency of the region to the constitutional institutions | 26/6/2018 |
| 196. | Bill of the council of women's affairs in Kurdistan Region | 26/6/2018 |
| 197. | Bill of amending anti-terrorism No. (3) for the year 2006 in Kurdistan Region | 26/6/2018 |
| 198. | Project of resolution considering what happened in Sinjar is a crime against humanity. | 26/6/2018 |
| 199. | Bill on the protection of water and sanitation networks | 2/7/2018 |
| 200. | Decision project on reception in accordance with the Protocol | 2/7/2018 |
| 201. | Rent estate amendment law No. (87) for the year 1979 as amended in the region | 9/7/2018 |
| 202. | Bill of amending the highways in the region 3 for the year 2012 | 9/7/2018 |
| 203. | Decision project to acquire lands that have been exceeded in the limits of municipalities | 9/7/2018 |
| 204. | Bill (third amendment to the real estate rent law No. (87) for the year 1979 as amended in the region | 10/7/2018 |
| 205. | Freezing the establishment of the presidency of the region | 10/7/2018 |
| 206. | Bill of amending the judicial institute in the region | 11/7/2018 |
| 207. | Bill of (quality control system in Kurdistan Region of Iraq) | 15/7/2018 |
| 208. | Bill of protection of the national symbols | 15/7/2018 |
| 209. | Bill of (compensation for war victims in Kurdistan) | 15/7/2018 |
| 210. | Project activation law (law on the protection of witnesses, experts, informants and victims No. (58) for the year 2017) | 15/7/2018 |
| 211. | Bill of activating (import and sale of petroleum products No. (9) for the year 2006) | 15/7/2018 |
| 212. | Bill of activating (the law of controlling smuggled funds and prohibited circulation in local markets No. (18) For the year 2008). | 15/7/2018 |
| 213. | Decision project of reviving the week of religious coexistence in Kurdistan Region | 15/7/2018 |

- The Parliament members and the government presented 309 bills and resolutions, 213 of which were given the first reading and were directed to the relevant committees, 96 others were not given their first reading, which means the parliament and not the parliament neither the committees were active enough that's why that big number of bills were left and not passed into laws, only 10% of bills presented were passed into laws.
- Many bills, even after a lot of work by the committees, were not given their second reading. Several bills were presented to the fourth parliamentary term, including (salary and allowance reform bill, the amendment to counter-terrorism law, activating the human trafficking law, and the second reading for the social support law), in brief, the bills that were in the public's interest were not passed.

Bills passed into Laws during the fourth parliamentary term

The Bills that were passed during the fourth term of the parliament

Bills passed in 2014:

1. Law number 1 for the year of 2014, the third amendment of the Presidency Law of Kurdistan region – Iraq for the year of 2005 amended.¹
2. Law number 2 for the year of 2014, extending the Counter-terrorism Law number 3 for the year of 2006 in Kurdistan Region of Iraq.²
3. Law number 4 for the year of 2014, the Independent High Elections and Referendum Commission.³
4. Law number 5 for the year of 2014, providing the political parties with budgets Law in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.⁴
5. The first amendment of Regulating the Demonstrations Law in Kurdistan Region. (was rejected by the president of Kurdistan Region)⁵
6. Law number 6 for the year of 2014 – Official Languages in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.⁶
7. Law number 7 for the year of 2014 – the first amendment for the Integrity General Board Law number 3 for the year of 2011 in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.⁷
8. Law number 8 for the year of 2014 – the tenth amendment of the Council of Ministers Law number 3 for the year of 1992 amended in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.⁸
9. Law number 9 for the year of 2014, the first amendment of the Minister of Higher Education and Scientific Research Law.⁹

¹ This law had only one article amended that was implemented during the ninth cabinet of Kurdistan Regional Government.

² This was the same law as in the past, it was only extended for another two years.

³ Even though the Independent High Elections and Referendum Commission was formed, the commission was not able to carry out its tasks properly.

⁴ Passing this bill into a law was good so that the region's budget is protected from being wasted by political parties, but the it was passed when the region was going through a financial crisis and the law was not being implemented, and based on this law the government will owe the parties. According to article 7 of law number 5 for the year of 2014 providing budgets for the political parties in Kurdistan Region – Iraq: "this law will be effective from the date of publishing it in the official Gazette." The law was published, which means the government does owe money to the political parties.

⁵ This law was rejected by the president of Kurdistan Region after one month and nine days of it being passed, then after two months and four days of its rejection, the parliament presidency put it back into their agenda in session 7 on October 22nd, 2014 and it was postponed for the next session. Based on president's decision number 6 for the year of 2014 which was issued on August 18th, 2014, and the region presidency's letter number (d. 497) issued on August 24th, 2014 to the parliament's presidency, this law was rejected, it was supposed to be put back into the parliaments spring sitting to be passed again, but this was not done.

⁶ The Official Languages Law was passed with many shortcomings when it was passed, due to the parliament members and the government's representative not being familiar with the content of the issue, now that it's been one year since passing it, the law is still not put into effect, as implementing and following up with it is not assigned to any party or institution.

⁷ The first reading of this bill was illegal, as the reading given to it in session 2 on September 23rd, 2014 was requested by the Integrity Board, which is illegal since that board is not allowed to present bills to the parliament, which is why in session 7 of the parliament the first reading was repeated for the bill, but this time the bill was presented by the legal number parliament members, the bill was passed which raised many negative reactions, that's why the president of Kurdistan Region rejected it, but it was later passed by the parliament again.

⁸ This law was only adding a minister (a minister without a ministry) position to the council of ministers to have a political party content, the bill was suggested by the council of ministers.

⁹ While discussing this bill by the parliament, the ministry of Higher Education and Scientific Research should've attended the discussion, however, despite being informed by the parliament, the minister, based on a

Laws that were approved in 2015:

1. Law number 1 for the year of 2015, the law of Halabja Governorate administration in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.¹
2. Law number 2 for the year of 2015, the law of Kurdistan Fund for Petrol and Gas Returns.²
3. Law number 3 for the year of 2015, the amendment act of carrying out the amended Iraqi Penal Code No.111 (1969) in the KRI.³
4. Law number 4 for the year of 2015, the law of Draft Preparation of the KRI Constitution.⁴
5. Law number 5 for the year of 2015, Minorities' Rights Protection Law in KRI.⁵
6. Law number 6 for the year of 2015, the 2nd amendment act of the amended Personal Status Law Implementation No. 188 (1959) in the KRI.⁶
7. Law number 7 for the year of 2015, Funds Withdrawal by Borrowing Law in KRI. ⁷
8. Law number 8 for the year of 2015, stop work act of the Real Estate Rental Law No.9 (2008) in KRI.⁸
9. Law number 9 for the year of 2015, law of rights and privileges of lone survivors of genocide in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.⁹

request from the council of ministers, based on our follow up. Even though the law was approved but so far instructions are not issued, and the law is not in effect.

¹ This law is approved but until now it is not properly put in effect and the institutions of this administration are not formed, and the members of the governorate council are not identified yet.

² The law was not put in effect, the members were supposed to be identified within three months, but until now practical steps haven't been taken and instructions haven't been issued regarding the law.

³ This law is still not in effect.

⁴ This is a consensus law that has the committee members tied up, in the law the committee is to have 21 members, so far only 20 members have started working. The legal period has ended based on the law, but the works of the committee are not finished yet. The parliament had to extend the period, and this is not done as well.

⁵ This is one of the good civil laws that ensures that all religions and ethnicities will practice their rights, if the law is put into effect.

⁶ This law's instructions haven't been issued, the courts don't implement it as needed and the law is not in effect.

⁷ Despite causing a lot of disagreements, the bill was passed during regular meeting number 13 on June 2nd, 2015, but the way it was passed was illegal as during the discussion and voting process for many of the articles in the law a quorum was not present in the hall. Later, due to a memorandum and follow up by (PAY Institute) which monitored the circumstances of passing the bill, we informed the presidency of the parliament passing this bill requires going back into the parliament hall as the passing process was illegal, the presidency returned the bill to the parliament and in session number 15 on June 16th, 2015 the bill was voted on again. Until this moment the law is not in effect, and later the council of ministers announced that they have stopped giving any debts.

⁸ This law only has one article, which announced stopping the implementation of the law for one year.

⁹ The instructions for this law haven't been issued and the law is so far not in effect.

Laws that were approved in 2017:

1. Law number 1 for the year of 2017, Law extending the legal period of the fourth term of the Parliament of Kurdistan Region
2. Law number 2 for the year of 2017, Law on the distribution of powers of the presidency of the region to public constitutional institutions.
3. Law number 3 for the year of 2017, regarding the second amendment to the application of the law of rents in real estate No. (87) for the year 1979, amended in the Kurdistan region of Iraq.¹
4. Law No. (4) for the year 2017 on granting a general amnesty in Kurdistan region of Iraq.²

Laws that were approved in 2018:

1. Law number 1 for the year of 2018, on organizing the transplantation and transport of human organs.
2. Law number 2 for the year of 2018 concerning the first amendment to the Traffic Law number 86 for the year of 2004 in the Kurdistan Region.
3. Law number 3 for the year of 2018 on the excesses on state property in Kurdistan Region - Iraq
4. Law number 4 for the year of 2018 on retirement, salaries, privileges, grants and allowances in Kurdistan Region – Iraq.³
5. Law number 5 for the year of 2018, activating the law of the twentieth amendment to the Law of Staffing number 25 for the year of 1960.⁴
6. Law number 6 for the year of 2018, Activating the Law of Combating Human Trafficking number 28 for the year of 2012 in Iraq.⁵
7. Law number 7 for the year of 2018, extension of the anti-terrorism law number 3 for the year of 2006.⁶
8. Law number 8 for the year of 2018, amending the third law of law number 17 for the year of 1999, amended in Kurdistan Region.¹

¹ This law was approved on December 6th, 2017.

² This law was approved on December 17th, 2017. This was one of the laws that was approved illegally and caused disagreements, in addition to releasing many convicts from prison.

³ This law was approved on February 27th, 2018. Due to the public pressure, some of the blocs announced their disagreement with the law pretending not to like it, so on March 4th, 2018 the parliament presidency denounced their decision and turned back the law to the parliament to be discussed again, but they failed to discuss the law again.

⁴ This law was put in effect on June 6th, 2018.

⁵ This law was put in effect on June 26th, 2018. This law was approved in Iraq, and the Kurdistan parliament approved the law as it is without considering the different conditions and situations in Kurdistan. The death penalty came back into the Kurdistan region laws, with not parliament member voting no to death penalty, while they all lobby for respect for human rights.

⁶ This law was approved on July 1st, 2018. The law was extended by the votes of (PUK, KDP, CM, KIU) parliament members, while the blocs of (KIG and KIM) were against the extension of the law. This caused a lot of criticism and comments from journalists as well.

9. Law number 9 for the year of 2018, the fourth amendment to the Law of the Pension Fund of Lawyers number 18 for the year of 1999, amended in Kurdistan Region.²
10. Law number 10 for the year of 2018, law of freezing the presidency of the region.³
11. Law number 11 for the year of 2018, the third amendment to the law of renting real estate law number 87 for the year of 1979 amended in Kurdistan Region.⁴

¹ This law was approved on July 2nd, 2018.

² This law was approved on July 2nd, 2018. In the reasons for approving this law, it's stated that in order to protect the rights of lawyers and providing a deserving life for them and their families, and considering the development, social and economic changes, this law was approved.

³ This law was approved on July 11th, 2018, and this also was criticized by many political parties, academic people and journalists.

⁴ This law was approved on July 15th, 2018.

Resolutions approved during the fourth parliamentary term

- 1- resolution number 16 for the year of 2014, resolution to stop working with the resolution number 55 for the year of 2004 and the resolution number 7 for the year of 1992 of Kurdistan Region Parliament - Iraq.
- 2- Decision number 18 for the year of 2014, resolution specific for the interior forces and the Asaysh.
- 3- Resolution number 18, resolution specific to the Peshmarga forces.
- 4- Resolution number 23, resolution to name Halabja the capital of peace for Kurdistan Region – Iraq.
- 5- Resolution number 24 for the year of 2014, resolution for supporting West Kurdistan People with the self-government form that they choose.¹
- 6- Resolution number 28 for the year of 2014, resolution for sending Kurdistan Region - Iraq Peshmerga forces to defend Kobane.²
- 7- resolution number 1 for the year of 2015, resolution for the candidacy and acceptance of mayors and townships administrators in KRI.³
- 8- Resolution number 17 for the year of 2018, welcoming the receiving the members of the parliament, the council of ministers, and other government staff with similar positions at the airports and boarder points, based on protocol.⁴

¹ The parliament should've clearly recognize the cantons in the resolution, but there was not any recognition in the resolution.

² In the resolution they should've mentioned that the force that goes to Kobane should be going with the cooperation and consent of the cantons in West Kurdistan, even though more than 3 parliamentarians asked for that, but the speaker of the parliament didn't give it the chance of a voting process and didn't add that part to the resolution. The date of this process should've been identified in the resolution, but no dates were mentioned or identified.

³ This resolution is in effect.

⁴ This resolution was approved on July 11th, 2018.

Recommendation:

- on 15/Sep/2017 the parliament has issued a five-point recommendation about the referendum and independency of Kurdistan.

Parliament's recommendations about referendum

First: Kurdistan parliament assigned the higher independent commission of election and referendum to conduct referendum in Monday 25/Sep/2017 in Kurdistan region and all the Kurdistan zones outside of the region.

Second: Kurdistan parliament will approve all the procedures that the higher independent commission of election and referendum and all related parties have taken to succeed the process of referendum.

Third: the higher commission of elections and referendum, about the legal mechanisms of managing the process of referendum for an independent Kurdistan, depends on the law of Kurdistan parliament election No. 1 of the year 1992 amended, and the law of higher independent commission of election and referendum No. 4 of the year 2014 or any other related law.

Fourth: the Kurdistan parliament will set free the related parties to take any procedure or decision to provide the right of self-determination and all the rights of Kurdistan nation, in a way that in the fateful matters they should refer to Kurdistan parliament and Kurdistan parliament assigns the higher independent commission of election and referendum to collaborate with such parties.

Fifth and final: the recommendations about are related to the announced referendum in 25/Sep/2017.

The new rules of procedure of Kurdistan parliament:

This rule was passed in 17/Jul/2018. Although when passed, it was decided that this rule should be implemented in the fourth term, but even now and in fifth term most of its items and articles did not get implemented.

Table No. 10
The level of implementing laws and resolutions of fourth term of Kurdistan parliament

| No. | Topic | Implemented | Violated | Not implemented | Total |
|-------|-------------------------------|-------------|----------|-----------------|-------|
| 1 | Law | 7 | 9 | 17 | 33 |
| 2 | Resolution | 2 | 0 | 6 | 8 |
| 3 | Parliament rules of procedure | 0 | 1 | 0 | 1 |
| Total | | 9 | 10 | 23 | 42 |

Table No. 11
Type of laws that were passed in the fourth term of Kurdistan parliament

| No. | Topic | No. of law |
|-------|-----------------------|------------|
| 1 | New law | 15 |
| 2 | Amending law | 12 |
| 3 | Extended law | 4 |
| 4 | Implemented Iraqi law | 2 |
| Total | | 33 |

Table No. 12
Passed and rejected law in the fourth term of Kurdistan parliament

| No. | Topic | No. of law |
|-------|-------------------------------|------------|
| 1 | Passed law | 31 |
| 2 | Rejected law | 2 |
| 3 | Parliament rules of procedure | 0 |
| Total | | 33 |

*- In five years, the parliament passed only 32 laws and 8 resolutions, although 213 draft laws got the second read. Most of the passed laws weren't implemented, or they got violated, and the parliament tolerated this.

*- The laws that passed in that period most of them caused negative opinions and outcomes, e.g. the law of extending the elections of fourth term of Kurdistan parliament, the law of distributing the authorities of presidency of Kurdistan region on the constitutional establishments of the region, law of general pardon in Kurdistan region, law of donation and planting human organs, law of prevention of exceeding over the land and property of government and removing them, law of suspension of establishment of presidency of the region, law of termination of human trafficking, third amendment of law of implementing renting real estate.

*- The passed resolutions did not get implemented or they were violated, without any action from the parliament.

*- In the fourth term, several Iraqi laws were passed. This was a shame to Kurdistan parliament, which it should have had its own laws, not passing Iraqi ones.

*- Issuing a new rules of procedure was a positive work, although there are notes about it, but the parliament stated that when the rules of procedure is passed it will be implemented, but

the term ended and only the deputy and the secretary's titles changed to first deputy and second deputy and no other items implemented, this adjustment is against the law of election because in it the terms of deputy and secretary exist not the first deputy and second deputy, neither the mentioned committees got disbanded or merged, nor the management structure of parliament was identified, etc.

*- according to our follow-up and the table above, from the total of 32 laws, only 7 of them were implemented, 9 of them were violated, 16 of them weren't implemented at all. From the total of 8 resolutions, only 2 of them were implemented, the other 6 weren't implemented. About the rules of procedure of parliament that was issued in 2018, most of its items either violated or weren't implemented at all.

And according to this, although the parliament's oversight for the executive authority had long been weak, the legislation is under threat of weakening because their laws are chaotic.

Budget in the parliament

First: draft law of budget:

One of the main tasks of Parliament is to pass the annual budget law. According to the rules of procedure of parliament, the council of ministers of Kurdistan region must send the evaluated budget to Parliament in October of each year¹, because the annual budget ends on 31/December and at the beginning of the new year, work must be done according to the new budget for the new year. But in the five years of fourth term of parliament, the council of ministers did not send the budget of the (2014, 2015, 2016, 2017, 2018) years to Parliament and the Parliament did not issue any requests to the government to question that violate, that's why the budget of this term wasn't passed in the parliament.

Second: the final accounts

According to the rules of procedure², the final accounts of the previous fiscal year must be sent to the parliament, to know how the budget was spent and the expenditures so the parliament and the people of Kurdistan know, because the budget is for the people of Kurdistan and to fix in place the principles of transparency in spending the budget.

In addition to the fact that the budget wasn't passed in the parliament, the government distributed the available budget according to its desire, without any oversight, that is why the final accounts of 2012, 2013, 2014, 2015, 2016, 2017 and 2018 years weren't sent to the parliament and no one knew how that budget distributed or spent, the parliament had no roles.

¹ in the first clause of article 79 of rules of procedure of the parliament, it states that: first: in the beginning of October before the fiscal year the budget must be sent to the parliament.

² in the second clause of article 79 of rules of procedure of the parliament, it states that: second: the draft laws of general budget and final accounts of each year upon their arrival they should be referred to the committee of finance and economic affairs for the purpose of audition and discussion.

Parliament and Monitoring the Executive Authority

One of the fundamental duties of parliament is monitoring the executive authority, in its five years, the fourth term of Kurdistan parliament despite all the crises, problems, violations to law by executive authority, but the parliament in its role as overseeing the government didn't have any roles or activities to carry out its duties. Other than some meetings that the government and the parliament held, the meetings were in a frame that the government wanted to execute its agenda through the parliament, not that the parliament should've monitor the government and question it. All the government violations to the law including saving the salary and reducing it to a quarter and even not distributing it in some months in its time, which some classes of employees were not receiving any salary even after three months, the sale of oil and non-transparency of its incomes, manipulating the elections, corruption in most sectors, poor service of education, health, higher education, roads, and scarcity of fuel, electricity and water, increasing the taxes illegally and tens of other matters, although several parliamentarians were submitting memos to summon the presidency of council of ministers and other ministers, but the parliament did not listen to its members and couldn't question any government officials.

The parliament couldn't question any of president of council of ministers or his deputy and couldn't summon them to the parliament. Although some parliamentarians tried to summon some of the ministers, including minister of natural resources, finances, municipality, martyrs, higher education, (the council of oil and gas of the region which included the president of council of ministers, deputy of president of council of ministers, minister of finances, ministers of natural resources, minister of planning, and the independent commission of election and referendum, but neither the presidency of parliament began the summoning process nor the ministers attended the parliament.¹ Not just this but the parliament was under the control of the executive authority and the government conducted several illegal and unconstitutional behaviors and steps against the parliament².

What is related to this matter is the attendance of several ministers as guests in the Kurdistan parliament for discussion with the parliamentarians, such as the minister of natural resources³, minister of education⁴, minister of Peshmarga⁵, minister of parliament affairs⁶, minister of health, minister of finance and minister of agriculture.

¹ The parliamentarians that in some of their memos and requests wanted to summon and question the ministers and establishments were Soran Omar, Sherko Jawdat, Gasha Dara Hafid, Goran Azad, Ali Hama Salih and some other parliamentarians that wrote a common memo and signed it, but none of the ministers and officials did not attend and did not respond to the summon, not just this but some of the parliamentarians that submitted this memo faced threats and some of them got insulted and degraded.

² For example, the parliament has requested the council of ministers numerous times to make ministers attend the parliament hall, but the council of ministers responded negatively to the request of the parliament.

³ The minister of natural resources upon the request of quorum of parliamentarians (which states according to article 54/second point/clause2 of the parliament rules of procedure- each ten member may request insert the discussion of a general topic to the parliament agenda with the attendance of the prime ministers of concerned minister) in the regular session No. 14 of the parliament in 7/Jul/2014.

⁴ In the regular session No. 6 in 21/Oct/2014, the minister of education attended the parliament session, the attendance of minister of education in this session was upon the request of the minister.

⁵ In the regular session No. 7 in 22/Oct/2014, the minister of Peshmarga attended the session of the parliament while the parliament was approving a resolution to send forces to Kobani

⁶ The minister of parliament affairs attended the session three times only: once in approving the resolution of supporting Rojava nation in 14/Oct, once with the minister of education in 21/Oct, once with the minister of Peshmarga in 22/Oct, this is while the mentioned minister's job address and office is inside the parliament building.

Sessions of fourth term of Kurdistan parliament

Table No. 13

| No. | No. and date of session of parliament |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1 | Session of 6/Nov/2013, starting the term and members taking oath. |
| 2 | Session in 29/Apr/2014 election of board of presidency |
| 3 | Regular session No. 1 in 4/May/2014 |
| 4 | Regular session No. 2 in 7/May/2014 |
| 5 | Regular session No. 3 in 13/May/2014 |
| 6 | Regular session No. 4 in 14/Oct/2014 |
| 7 | Regular session No. 5 in 20/May/2014 |
| 8 | Regular session No. 6 in 26/May/2014 |
| 9 | Regular session No. 7 in 28/May/2014 |
| 10 | Regular session No. 8 in 15/Jun/2014 |
| 11 | Regular session No. 9 in 16/Jun/2014 |
| 12 | Regular session No. 10 in 18/Jun/2014 |
| 13 | Regular session No. 11 in 29/Jun/2014 |
| 14 | Regular session No. 12 in 30/Jun/2014 |
| 15 | Regular session No. 13 in 1/Jul/2014 |
| 16 | Regular session No. 14 in 7/Jul/2014 |
| 17 | Regular session No. 15 in 9/Jul/2014 |
| 18 | Regular session No. 16 in 17/Jul/2014 |
| 19 | Regular session No. 17 in 22/Jul/2014 |
| 20 | Regular session No. 18 in 23/Jul/2014 |
| 21 | Regular session No. 19 in 24/Jul/2014 |
| 22 | Unusual session No. 2 in 25/Aug/2015 |
| 23 | Regular starting session No. 1 in 3/Sep/2014 |
| 24 | Regular session No. 2 in 23/Sep/2014 |
| 25 | Regular session No. 3 in 30/Sep/2014 |
| 26 | Regular session No. 4 in 14/Oct/2014 |
| 27 | Regular session No. 5 in 15/Oct/2014 |
| 28 | Regular session No. 6 in 21/Oct/2014 |
| 29 | Regular session No. 7 in 22/Oct/2014 |
| 30 | Regular session No. 8 in 28/Oct/2014 |
| 31 | Regular session No. 9 in 29/Oct/2014 |
| 32 | Regular session No. 10 in 10/Nov/2014 |
| 33 | Regular session No. 11 in 19/Nov/2014 |
| 34 | Regular session No. 12 in 25/Nov/2014 |
| 35 | Regular session No. 13 in 26/Nov/2014 |
| 36 | Regular session No. 14 in 3/Dec/2014 |
| 37 | Regular session No. 15 in 9/Dec/2014 |
| 38 | Regular session No. 16 in 16/Dec/2014 |
| 39 | Regular session No. 17 in 18/Dec/2014 |
| 40 | Regular session No. 18 in 23/Dec/2014 |

| | |
|----|-----------------------------------------------|
| 41 | Regular session No. 19 in 24/Dec/2014 |
| 42 | Regular session No. 20 in 29/Dec/2014 |
| 43 | Regular session No. 21 in 31/Dec/2014 |
| 44 | Unusual session No. 1 in 27/Jan/2015 |
| 45 | Unusual session No. 2 in 5/Feb/2015 |
| 46 | Starting Session No. 1 in 3/Mar/2015 |
| 47 | Regular session No. 2 in 9/Mar/2015 |
| 48 | Regular session No. 3 in 10/Mar/2015 |
| 49 | Regular session No. 4 in 24/Mar/2015 |
| 50 | Regular session No. 5 in 31/Mar/2015 |
| 51 | Regular session No. 6 in 1/Apr/2015 |
| 52 | Regular session No. 7 in 7/Apr/2015 |
| 53 | Regular session No. 8 in 13/Apr/2015 |
| 54 | Regular session No. 9 in 21/Apr/2015 |
| 55 | Regular session No. 10 in 29/Apr/2015 |
| 56 | Regular session No. 11 in 20/May/2015 |
| 57 | Regular session No. 12 in 26/May/2015 |
| 58 | Regular session No. 13 in 2/June/2015 |
| 59 | Regular session No. 14 in 9/June/2015 |
| 60 | Regular session No. 15 in 16/June/2015 |
| 61 | Regular session No. 16 in 17/June/2015 |
| 62 | Regular session No. 17 in 23/June/2015 |
| 63 | Regular session No. 18 in 29/June/2015 |
| 64 | Regular session No. 19 in 30/June/2015 |
| 65 | Unusual session No. 3 in 19/Aug/2015 |
| 66 | Regular starting session No. 1 in 2/Sep/2015 |
| 67 | Regular session No. 2 in 16/Sep/2015 |
| 68 | Regular session No. 3 in 20/Sep/2015 |
| 69 | Regular session No. 4 in 21/Sep/2015 |
| 70 | Regular session No. 5 in 6/Oct/2015 |
| 71 | Regular session No. 6 in 7/Oct/2015 |
| 72 | Regular session No. 7 in 12/Oct/2015 |
| 73 | Unusual session in 15/Sep/2017 |
| 74 | Regular starting session No. 1 in 23/Sep/2017 |
| 75 | Regular starting session No. 2 in 30/Sep/2017 |
| 76 | Regular starting session No. 3 in 24/Oct/2017 |
| 77 | Regular starting session No. 4 in 29/Oct/2017 |
| 78 | Regular starting session No. 5 in 15/Nov/2017 |
| 79 | Regular starting session No. 2 in 6/Dec/2017 |
| 80 | Regular session No. 3 in 13/Dec/2017 |
| 81 | Regular session No. 3 in 13/Dec/2017 |
| 82 | Regular session No. 4 in 10/Jan/2018 |
| 83 | Regular session No. 5 in 30/Jan/2018 |
| 84 | Regular session No. 6 in 31/Jan/2018 |
| 85 | Regular session No. 7 in 6/Feb/2018 |
| 86 | Regular session No. 8 in 12/Feb/2018 |
| 87 | Regular session No. 9 in 13/Feb/2018 |
| 88 | Regular session No. 10 in 21/Feb/2018 |
| 89 | Regular session No. 12 in 26/Feb/2018 |
| 90 | Regular session No. 13 in 27/Feb/2018 |
| 91 | Regular session No. 14 in 5/Mar/2018 |
| 92 | Regular session No. 14 in 6/Mar/2018 |
| 93 | Regular starting session in 7/May/2018 |
| 94 | Regular session No. 1 in 21/May/2018 |

| | |
|-----|--------------------------------------|
| 95 | Regular session No. 1 in 12/Jun/2018 |
| 96 | Regular session No. 2 in 1/Jul/2018 |
| 97 | Regular session No. 3 in 2/Jul/2018 |
| 98 | Regular session No. 4 in 9/Jul/2018 |
| 99 | Regular session No. 5 in 10/Jul/2018 |
| 100 | Regular session No. 6 in 11/Jul/2018 |
| 101 | Regular session No. 7 in 15/Jul/2018 |
| 102 | Regular session No. 8 in 17/Jul/2018 |
| 103 | Final sealing session in 31/Oct/2018 |

*- The number of the meetings of the parliament was few in comparison to the five years. According to the official agenda, the parliament has held 104 sessions, this is not appropriate to the existing volume of the problems and crises.

Disabling the parliament and prevention of its president

In its fourth term, the Kurdistan parliament has been disabled; we can categorize this disabling into two stages:

First: the stage prior to the prevention of speaker of parliament:

In this stage, the parliament was disabled in two different styles and two different stages:

1- when in 19/Aug/2015 the Kurdistan parliament, in the process of amending the law of presidency of Kurdistan region, couldn't collect the quorum of its members and hold a meeting, in the same time and date the ruling of esteemed Masoud Barzani the president of the region was ending, by this, from this date, the Kurdistan region fell into a legal void, the president of Kurdistan region term ended and the parliament disabled, because when it was issuing resolutions there were no one to fix signatures legally, because of this when the legislative break of parliament ended, it got busy with approving the rules of procedure instead of approving the laws, the reason of this was the rules of procedure of parliament, after approving it, did not need the signature of the president of the region.

It was because of this also that at that time the protests of Kurdistan people developed, and the crises were at peak, the wellbeing of the people was terrible, and the salary and incomes were cut off, the parliament couldn't question any minister or summon them to the parliament.

So before preventing the president of the parliament in 12/Oct and disabling the parliament politically, the parliament got disabled in the matter of law, in that time in 19/Aug till 12/Oct/2015 did not discuss any law in general and the law of the presidency of the region.

2- Because of the political tensions in the region and the five wing meetings were on hold, in 12/Oct/2015 while returning to parliament, the president of the parliament got prevented by Kurdistan Democratic Party in Pirde check-point. This prevention got the parliament disabled politically and the formal meetings that it was holding, stopped.

The prevention of speaker of parliament was after that according to an announcement of Change movement, the political bureau of Kurdistan Democratic Party from Sunday 11/Oct/2015 has decided that the ministry and parliament team of Change movement including the speaker of parliament are no longer to be in the government and they must leave Erbil. This was an illegal behavior, because the president of Kurdistan parliament which is the second sovereign position in the country after the president of the region, but preventing him to enter the capital.¹

The same day the president of the parliament after returning, at the office of parliament with the attendance of the representatives of Blocs of Change, Patriotic Union of Kurdistan, United Islamic Kurdistan and Kurdistan Islamic Group held a press conference and announced: prevention of the speaker of parliament and parliamentarians to enter Erbil city is

¹ About this matter, Ary Harsin, KDP bloc parliamentarian stated that the prevention of president of parliament was for the sake of the security of his life and said: "preventing Yusif Muhammed to come to Erbil is to protect the security of his life, what has been done to our members in Sulaymani in the previous days resulted in angering their family members here, I suspect there might be people want to revenge because they uphold him of the incidents."

a form of coup d'état. He also mentioned that what has happened is a bad development in the political process and it will lead Kurdistan astray, because the Kurdistan parliament has received its legitimacy from the people and only the people can withdraw its legitimacy, Kurdistan is our workplace, so we will continue to work wherever we may be.

About this matter, Fakhraddeen Qadir, the secretary of the parliament announced a statement and condemned this behavior against the president of the parliament.

In the same day, eight Blocs of the parliament (Patriotic Union of Kurdistan, Change Movement, Kurdistan Islamic Union, Turkmen Front, Sons of Two Rivers and Freedom Bloc) condemned the prevention of speaker of parliament and released a statement.

About this matter, the spokesperson of Kurdistan Democratic Party Bloc (Muhammed Ali Yassin) announced: we have made lots of efforts to prevent the development of the situation into this manner, but Change made us decide such decision, from now on Yusuf Muhammed is not the president of the parliament, another person will be assigned as the president of the parliament. The lists of Social Democratic Party in Kurdistan, Third Direction, Rafidain, Assyrian Syriac Chaldean Popular Group, Turkmen Progress, Turkmen Erbil, Change, Turkmen Renewal and Arman did not have any statements about this matter and did not show any formal stance about this matter. This event echoed in the international media and it had a negative effect, the media were interested in this matter. As the result of this event in 12/Oct/2015 and the later preventions, a complete legal violation was made against the parliament and it got disabled completely, which represent in violating the following points and articles of this resolution and laws:

First: violation of resolution No. 1 of the year 2005 of Kurdistan parliament.

Second: violation of law No. 1 of the year 1992 of elections of Kurdistan parliament-Iraq.

Third: violation of rules of procedure of Kurdistan parliament.

In the light of these interpretations we can say the fact that Kurdistan parliament was disabled politically in 12/Oct/2015 but prior to this date in 19/Aug/2015 the parliament got disabled in the matter of legality.

Second: the stage of reactivating the parliament:

After the Kurdistan parliament started its sessions again in 15/Sep/2017, a circumstance came forward that resulted in violating the rules of procedure and the sessions were unusual, for several reasons:

1- according to the rules of procedure, when a parliament meeting is in progress, the president should invite the members and the agenda should be signed and announced, but the president of the parliament had been prevented to return to parliament, i.e. his absence was out of his will and control, this is a violation of rules of procedure and an illegal action, that is why the meetings were running by the deputy speaker.

2- while the meetings were in progress in 26/Dec/2017, the president of the parliament has submitted his resignation at his will to the parliament, but again the law and rules of procedure were violated, and his resignation letter was not inserted in the agenda and was not approved, and the parliament remained president-less until the end of its term.

According to the text in the rules of procedure of parliament in clause 2 of article 16 states that: "in case the president of the parliament or his deputy or the secretary were void for any reason, the parliament, after the first session without the mentioned posts and according to

this rules of procedure a replacement will be chosen for the mentioned posts”, what was strange was the parliament did not approve the resignation of the president and did not let him come back and that point of the rules of procedure did not get nullified, therefor what was going on was not legal, again therefor the laws that were passed in that period were null, according to the context of law and policies, according to the law concept that states (what is based on falsehood is false).

This will bring forward a question; can the government be obliged to those laws? This was the work of council of justice and council of consult and currently it’s their work to express their opinions about it and resolve it! Because it wasn’t only an illegal session of parliament, it was the entire parliament that was running illegally!

These are all bringing forward an argument, are the laws that passed in the period of when the parliament started its meetings in 15/Sep/2017 and in 30/Sep/2017 Fakhraddeen Qadir the secretary of parliament was replaced by Begard Tallabany and Jaafar Eminky was assigned as the deputy speaker of the parliament and was running the meetings, have legal powers.

The parliament and preparing a draft constitution

The parliament should have started its first reading of the draft constitution of the Kurdistan region in the beginning of the fourth term, but because of the political disputes of the Blocs it was delayed, then the first reading of the draft was in November of 2014.

According to article 2 of law No. 19 of the year 2013 of Kurdistan parliament, states: “The draft constitution of the Region will be amended by census in two years from 2013—2015”, later it was clearly emphasized on this point in the statement of the president of the region in 27/Jul/2013. But Kurdistan parliament in general and board of presidency in specific failed in this matter, depending on these points:

1. In 25/Jul/2014 it was emphasized that the Bloc of patriotic union of Kurdistan has requested the presidency to work on this matter, the board of presidency promised in August of 2014 to work on it, but they did not.

2. In 11/Sep/2014 with the petition of the parliamentarians a draft was made to form a committee to read the draft of the constitution, but the board of presidency of the parliament didn't give it the first reading.

3. In November of 2014 a draft of bill has been written in census and 61 parliamentarians signed it and the board of presidency of parliament and head of Blocs signed it, but later this draft did not have any results too.

4. after the parliament was hopeless, the presidency of parliament visited all the political parties about this matter, after the approval of all the political parties then in 1/May/2015 the report of legal committee was signed and submitted and approved, this resulted the first meeting of the committee in 20/May/2015 and have a duration of three months, i.e. until 20/Aug/2015 which is the date of end of sovereign of the president of region, which was clear this couldn't solve this problem.

5. Because of political parties' disagreement on the political system and the lack of specified time of the committee, the committee couldn't finish the works in the allotted time, and the duration of the works of committee did not get extension.

6. according to clause 2 in article 3 of law No. 4 of the year 2015 the law of preparing the constitution of Kurdistan is the duty of parliament, the parliament after reactivating it in 2017 its first job should've been reactivating the committee of constitution and extension of the committee's time, because the law is still applicable, but the parliament's fourth term failed in this matter and couldn't do it.

It was the duty of Kurdistan parliament to work immediately and seriously to finish and prepare the draft constitution of Kurdistan region, which is according to article 20 in Iraqi constitution, the right of Kurdistan region to have a constitution, but after 14 years after this constitutional right even now, the region did not have a constitution of its own.

The parliamentarians that did not complete the fourth term and their reasons

In the fourth term of the parliament, several parliamentarians couldn't complete the term or didn't complete the term as shown in the table below along with the reason of their resignation:

Table No. 14

| No. | Resigned parliamentarians | Date of resignation or separation | Reason of resignation or separation | Replaced by this parliamentarian |
|-----|---------------------------|-----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------|
| 1 | Nuri Hama Ali | 15/6/2014 | For not having any posts in the parliament | Shamo Shekho Aamo |
| 2 | Arsalan Baiz Ismaeel | 25/5/2014 | For not being assigned as speaker of parliament | Sarkawt Sarhad |
| 3 | Darbza Adbullah Rasul | 29/6/2014 | Assigned as minister | Abas Fatah |
| 4 | Mawlwd Murad Muhialdin | 29/6/2014 | Assigned as minister | Bahzad Darwesh Darwesh |
| 5 | Farhad Hama Salih Sangawi | 30/9/2017 | Illegally expelled from parliament without his will | Goran Mahmoud Ismaeel |
| 6 | Fakhraldin Qadir Marf | 30/9/2017 | For being removed as the secretary of parliament | Aiyub Abdulla Ismaeel |
| 7 | Bayar Tahir Saeed | 23/9/2017 | It was decided to make him a member in Iraqi Election commission | Ali Osman Ali |
| 8 | Goran Azad Muhammed | 29/10/2017 | For tackling several corruption matters he received life threats | Mustafa Ahmad Hamad |
| 9 | Shwan Qaladzaii | 17/10/2017 | Passed away in traffic accident | Ary Abdullatif |
| 10 | Bapir Kamala | 17/12/2017 | For agreement with Kurdistan Toilers Party it was decided that each of them will be in parliament for two years | Did not have enough votes to resign |
| 11 | Yusif Muhammed Sadiq | 26/12/2017 | Prevented to go back to parliament | Did not insert in agenda and didn't get replacement |
| 12 | Rabun Marouf | 10/7/2018 | Prevented to enter parliament, later became a member in Iraqi House of Representatives | Approved but didn't get replacement |
| 13 | Bahar Mahmoud | May 2018 | Became a member in Iraqi House of Representatives | Did not insert in agenda and didn't get replacement |

1. The political Kurdish parties that had members in parliament neglected the role of parliament and its resolutions and recommendations were not regarded seriously, especially in the matter of presidency of Kurdistan region.

2. Although according to resolution No. 1 of the year 2005 that states the political presidency of Kurdistan must refer back to parliament about the fateful resolutions, but the role of parliament was not regarded in the political scope of Kurdistan region and parliament was marginalized in the important and fateful events.

3. The dominance of parliamentary work in Kurdistan was under threat, because it couldn't pass the bills that the executive authority was not approving, i.e. the government has dominated its supremacy over the parliament.

4. The laws, resolutions and recommendations of the parliament were not executed by the executive authority.

5. The media of some political parties were trying to degrade the parliament and its members.

6. To frustrate the parliamentarians of carrying out their duties, threats, degrading and violence were done against several of them. E.g. in Shaqlawa the parliamentarian Bahar Mahmoud had been degraded, member Farhad Sangawi was abducted by anonymous armed men, got insulted and tortured. Goran Azad received life threats (according to our information and investigations the mentioned person has sought asylum in a foreign country), the member Raboun Marouf has been attacked physically, got degraded and tortured and arrested, member Ali Hama Salih has been degraded, Bashar Mushir Agha's home got shots fired at it, Sherko Jawdat got degraded and prevented along with Soran Omar, the speaker of parliament and its members had been prevented numerous times in Degalla and Pirde check-points to return back to parliament, these actions and many more had been carried out against parliamentarians without differentiating any Blocs and political parties.

7. The parliamentarians were forced to ask for help from the justice authority and the public prosecutor, to file complaints about wasting the general budget and the corruption cases and violation of laws by the government and its officials, but until the end of the term, the court did not take any actions upon the requests of the parliamentarians.

8. Kurdistan Democratic Party has violated the law against the parliament when in 12/Oct/2015 the president of the parliament got prevented to enter the parliament. The other four political parties were not concerned and did not take practical steps to reactivating the parliament.

9. the process of exporting oil was one of the reasons of the crises, while the income box of oil products' law was approved in the parliament, but forming its counsel and giving confidence to its members in the parliament got disabled, the reason at that time was the dispute among the political parties about their share in the said counsel.

10. The practical attitude of most of parliamentarians were different than the attitude of their political parties, the members wanted to reactivate the parliament, but this seriousness was not seen in their political parties, the statement of none of the political parties did not match their practices.

11. The parliament or the acclaimed independent bodies didn't have financial independency, although legally they were independent, but practically they all waited for the ministry of finance to distribute their salaries or allocate a small budget for them.

12. The government was not assisting the parliament or the election commission and did not carry out its duty in preparing and organizing the record of voters, especially the ministries of commerce, justice, interior, Peshmarga, finances and counsel of Asaysh.

13. None of the political parties in the five years of 2013-2018 were not concerned about organizing the record of voters and did not work for it.

14. The government did not send the budget draft for five years to the parliament to be passed.

15. When the members of counsel of ministries' members were summoned the executive authority was not working upon the requests of parliament and its members and did not work for them.

16. Attaching the parliament by some people in 29/Oct/2017 that were encouraged and facilitated to enter the parliament, this was violating the parliament.

The violations and mistakes the parliament committed

1. The attitude of the presidency of parliament was normal and well in the beginning, but later it was not enough, and the media and press were prevented, and they weren't given information.
2. The committees of parliament were not carrying out their duties well enough, including reporting on the law drafts, this was a reason that made the parliament unable to hold meetings sufficiently, because the law drafts prepared by reports were not available to it, so it can put it in agenda.
3. The committees of parliament were not monitoring the ministries, bodies and directorates enough that were related to it and the oversight was poorly done.
4. On the scale of all the crises and problems facing the region and the first read of the large number of draft laws, the parliament meetings were few.
5. The parliamentarians in general were not carrying out their duties, including attending the general meetings of parliament, the meetings of committees, reporting on the draft laws and the oversight of executive authority.
6. The parliament was weak in questioning the executive authority; it couldn't summon the prime ministers, his deputy or any other minister to the parliament and question them in its five years.
7. The matter of presidency of the region which was the root cause of crises in the region was suspended and the Kurdistan parliament couldn't resolve it, this was also the cause of parliament's disabling.
8. The parliament was weak in monitoring the bodies that were related to it, such as the bodies of human rights, monitoring divan, integrity and elections commission, their works were either disabled or not sufficiently done.
9. The human rights body's president term was expired in 17/Jan/2017, the parliament should've in its fourth term and according to law, find a solution for said body, but no procedures were taken which is a violation of the law.
10. The integrity body's president term was expired in 13/May/2017, the parliament should've in its fourth term and according to law, find a solution for said body, but no procedures were taken which is a violation of the law.
11. The divan of monitoring and finances' president term was expired in 7/May/2017, the parliament should've in its fourth term and according to law, find a solution for said body, but no procedures were taken which is a violation of the law.
12. In the fourth term, the most violations of rules of procedure occurred.
13. The agenda was not announced in most of the parliament meetings.
14. Most parts of the meetings were closed and away from the media and the people of Kurdistan, although there were no sensitive matters that according to the rules of procedure the meetings should be closed, this caused an interruption between the people and the parliament and made the people suspect the parliament.
15. in the fourth term of the parliament the most number of Iraqi laws were read to be applicable in the region, this was a shame to the Kurdistan parliament, it had to have laws of its own not reading Iraqi ones.
16. The speaker of parliament submitted his resignation letter, but even until the end of the term, it was not inserted in the agenda, this was against of law and rules of procedure.
17. Some of the parliamentarians were not going to work and no questions were asked.
18. Each starting session needed to have a name, whether be it autumnal or vernal, but three consecutive starting sessions were named autumnal.

19. The meetings had a chaotic characteristic, such as: the name of the meetings and their dates were not clear, the meetings' numbers were mixed, in most of sessions the agenda items were getting interchanged; in the session items were added to the agenda, these are all signs of weakness and unprofessionalism of the presidency board.

20. The fourth term of Kurdistan parliament which was five years, passed 32 laws and issued 8 resolutions only, although the first read was made for 213 draft laws.

21. The democracy process in Kurdistan region was in a regressive state, the civil laws that were passed in the parliament, got violated and faced with obstacles and their freedom was restricted, e.g. the law No. 1 of the year 2011 of the non-governmental organization and law No. 11 of the year 2013 of obtaining information and law No. 5 of the year 2013 of partnered pledge and development between the general authorities and the non-governmental organizations and many other laws.

22. A mentality was prevailing in the parliament that prevented monitoring the performance of parliament and its work, this mentality did not believe in transparency and intended to hide the facts from the people and international bodies.

23. The parliament was not doing its works in preparing and organizing the record of voters, although it's the only establishment that can monitor the commission and follow-up its works.

24. The parliament couldn't question or investigate the government even with a question for not sending the draft budget of the region in the five years of the parliament term.

25. The matter of constitution was one of the important matters, the steps for it got stopped and it got suspended.

26. The matter of presidency of the region which was the main cause of crises of the region got suspended.

27. The process of exporting oil was one of the causes of the crises, although the oil income box got its law passed in the parliament, but parliament couldn't form its council and entrust its members.

28. the parliament couldn't question the government when filling in the position of the ministers, because the steps of the government were illegal, those positions will be filled when the ministers pass away or asks for it by themselves, this decision was under compulsion, if any decision is under compulsion, is false, because what is based of falsehood is false. This was a violation of law.

29. In most of the meetings of parliament the agenda wasn't announced, even if it got announced the members were notified few hours before the meeting formally, although according to the rules of procedure the duration should be 48 hours before the meeting before notifying the members about the agenda.

30. In some of the meetings the agenda was hidden from the members, e.g. the agenda of 30/Sep/2017 which included the resignation of Farhad Sangawi, and in meeting of 18/Dec/2017 which the meeting was delayed later. It is worth mentioning that the agenda was not posted in the website too, the news of the website that day didn't mention the resignation of Farhad Sangawi.

31. In 30/Sep/2017 the resignation letter of Farhad Sangawi got included in agenda and it was voted and he got resigned from the parliament, although the mentioned person did not submit his resignation letter, or being informed or attending the meeting.

32. In the meeting of 30/Sep/2017 Fakhraddeen Qadir got prevented to enter the parliament hall as the secretary of the parliament and to submit his resignation letter at his position as the secretary.

33. In some meetings the members weren't allowed to express their opinion, that's why in the meeting of 24/Dec/2017 which was related to the extension of parliament term, some members left the meeting and outside the hall through the media they expressed their opinions, this not allowing is against the rules of procedure.

34. In some of the meetings, in one meeting a draft law had its first read and in the same meeting and date, it had its second read and approval, this is against the rules of procedure, e.g. in the meeting of 24/Oct/2017 in the draft law of extension of parliament term, and in 29/Oct/2017 in the draft law of distributing the authorities of the president of the region.

35. Some parliamentarians resigned from their committees and their places weren't filled but their names were still under the committees' names, those committees were adjusted but the name of its members weren't published on the website.

36. in most of the meetings the agenda was adjusted, e.g. in the meeting No. 2 in 6/Dec/2017 and No. 3 in 17/Dec/2017 and No. 4 in 10/Jan/2018 and No. 5 in 30/Jan/2018 and No. 6 in 31/Jan/2018 and No. 7 in 6/Feb/2018 and No. 8 in 12/Feb/2018 and No. 9 in 13/Feb/2018 and No. 10 in 21/Feb/2018, this indicates that the presidency of the parliament isn't informed and inexperienced in forming the agenda.

37. In most of the meetings time was wasted by points of order, although it was not need, this indicates that the presidency of the parliament is weak and inexperienced in running the meetings.

38. according to clause No. 3 of first article of law No. 2 of the year 2017 law of distributing the authorities of president of the region upon the constitutional establishments of the region, the authority of fixing signatures is given to the presidency of the parliament, i.e. all three members (the president, the deputy and the secretary), but none of the laws that were passed did not have the signature of (the president).

39. A number of the draft laws in their first read of the sessions of the parliament weren't directed to the related committees sufficiently, there were draft laws that weren't handed over to the committee that it should.

40. In total of 352 clauses of agenda that was in the agenda of the sessions, 196 clauses were implemented, and 156 clauses were delayed in the sessions.

41. in the session of 17/Jul/2018 when the new rules of procedure passed, it was decided that the rules of procedure should be implemented in its passed date and issuance, but the term ended and none of the rules were implemented, except that the presidency board's names changed from the deputy and secretary to first deputy and second deputy.

42. when in 7/Aug/2014 the crises crime committed against the Sinjar and the Peshmarga forces withdrew, which resulted in displacement and fled of hundreds of thousands of people and the mass killing of the Yezidis, which was the reason of the abduction of thousands of Yezidi girls and women and their demise and got traded and raped, the parliament should've form an investigative committee and identify the reason of Peshmerga's withdrawal in such a hurry and punish the careless and the violators.¹ At that time the parliament was in holiday, according to article 48 clause B of the rules of procedure the presidency could've form a committee which was in its authority² but it wasn't formed, the excuse was that the presidency of the region has formed a committee for the same reason, but late the parliament didn't question the findings of this committee which was its duty to do so, this was when the committee of the president of the region didn't have any results, even now neither the presidency of the region nor the parliament didn't have a voice about the heartbreaking incident.

¹ article 47 of rules of procedure states: the parliament can form temporary and investigative commits, according to the need of the addressed topics.

² clause B of article 48 of rules of procedure states: in the holiday of the parliament, the investigative committees will be formed by the presidency board.

The result

Finally, we can point out the result of the works of Kurdistan parliament's fourth term in the following points:

| No. | Shortcomings in fourth term | What to do in fifth term |
|-----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. | The work of parliament wasn't transparent, information wasn't given to journalists, most of the meetings were closed away from the media and the people, although there weren't any sensitive topics, which according to the rules of procedure the meeting should be closed, this resulted in a separation between the people and the parliament and make parliament suspicious. | The information should be given to journalists according to the law. The meetings shouldn't be closed, and they should be broadcasted to the people, so the people may not be suspicious about the steps of the parliament and could trust. It. |
| 2. | In the fourth term, the most violations of rules of procedure occurred; in the most meetings of the parliament the agenda wasn't announced. The meetings were chaotic, the name of the terms and their dates were not known, the number of the meetings was mixed, the agenda was interchanging, and items were added to the agenda while in meeting, this is a sign of weakness and inexperience of the presidency board. | The rules of procedure should be implemented as it is and the violations of the fourth term should not be repeated, the terms should be named appropriately and the meetings should start in their time, the agenda should be announced to the members in its time and items should not be added or taken away secretly, the members should be allowed to express themselves in the context of rules of procedure, the rights and the duties of the members should be provided, the recommendations and requests of the members should be announced in its time. |
| 3. | Most of the parliamentarians did not carry their duties sufficiently, including the high percentage of absence in the meetings of the parliament, meeting of the committees, not writing reports on the draft laws, etc. | The members should carry their duties accordingly, the presidency of the parliament should take procedures on the shortcomings and the political parties should monitor them, they should attend the meetings |
| 4. | The committees of the parliament didn't carry out their duties accordingly from writing reports on the draft laws and they didn't monitor the ministries, bodies and departments and their oversight was weak. | The committees should write reports on the draft laws due time, they should be active in monitoring the ministries, bodies and departments that fall into the field of their expertise. |
| 5. | The number of the parliament meetings compared to its five years was not much, according to the formal agenda of parliament, it held 104 sessions, and this does not go along well with the rules of procedure and the sheer number of existing problems and crises. | The parliament should hold meetings when needed. |
| 6. | The members and the government have submitted 309 draft laws and resolutions, 213 of them had their first read and directed to the related committees, 96 | The draft laws should be submitted accordingly, they should be reported on by the related committees immediately and shouldn't be neglected; the presidency of parliament |

| | | |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | drafts were remained and weren't read, this implies that the parliament and the committees weren't active, that is why this large number of draft laws left and did not pass, only 10% of the submitted drafts were passed. | should take procedures in case of shortcomings of the committees. |
| 7. | A number of draft laws didn't get second read even after a huge effort from the committees. The fourth term had several important draft laws such as draft law of reform of salaries and incomes, amendment of anti-terrorism law, passing the law of human trafficking, the second read of draft law of social fund, but the laws which were in the interest of the people, weren't passed. | Until all aspects of the draft laws got studied upon, they shouldn't be worked on and waste time by them, when a draft law is completed, it should be put in the agenda and get approved. |
| 8. | In five years, the parliament passed only 32 laws and 8 resolutions, although 213 draft laws got the second read. Most of the passed laws weren't implemented, or they got violated, and the parliament tolerated this. | The parliament should pass laws according to the voids in the law, it should defend their implementation and if they weren't implemented the parliament should start questioning. |
| 9. | The laws that passed in that period most of them caused negative opinions and outcomes, e.g. the law of extending the elections of fourth term of Kurdistan parliament, the law of distributing the authorities of presidency of Kurdistan region on the constitutional establishments of the region, law of general pardon in Kurdistan region, law of donation and planting human organs, law of prevention of exceeding over the land and property of government and removing them, law of suspension of establishment of presidency of the region, law of termination of human trafficking, third amendment of law of implementing renting real estate. | The passed laws that have problems or negative opinions should be read and amended. |
| 10. | The passed resolutions did not get implemented or they were violated, without any action from the parliament. | The parliament should follow-up its resolutions and they should be implemented. |
| 11. | In the fourth term, several Iraqi laws were passed. This was a shame to Kurdistan parliament, which it should have had its own laws, not passing Iraqi ones. | The Kurdistan parliament should make effort to pass the most number of local laws related to the region and least number of Iraqi laws. |
| 12. | The political forces that had members in the parliament made the parliament's role unimportant, they weren't take into consideration the parliaments' resolutions and recommendations. | The parliament is the highest establishment legally, politically and lawfully of the region, its role shouldn't be disregarded. |

| | | |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 13. | The parliament's questioning of the executive authority was weak; it couldn't summon any of the prime ministers, his deputy or ministers to the parliament for questioning. | The parliament should carry its role in oversight of executive authority according to the rules of procedure. |
| 14. | The general media and the political parties' agencies tried to defame the parliament and its members. | The parliamentarians and their characters should be protected. |
| 15. | The issue of presidency of the region was the main cause of crises of the region and it was suspended. | The issue of presidency of the region should be dealt with and fixed according to the law. |
| 16. | In 12/Oct/2015 the Speaker of Parliament was prevented to enter the parliament, which is a violation of the law. This led to the regression of democracy and legitimacy in Kurdistan region and its reputation fall under question on local and international scale. This led to lack of the people's confidence in the Parliament despite being the highest establishment in the region and lack of confidence in voting and elections. Although this was done by the Kurdistan Democratic Party, the other four parties were not serious in taking action and seeking to take practical steps | The president of the parliament must not be prevented again. |
| 17. | Disabling the parliament affected negatively on the other formal establishments, e.g. the human rights body, divan of oversight, integrity body, elections commission and most of the works of these bodies either halted or weren't sufficiently done. The term of presidents of bodies of human rights, integrity, financial divan of oversight was ended, they needed solutions according to the law, but no procedures were taken, this was a violation of the law. | These bodies must be read, and their legal issues should be solved. |
| 18. | The process of importation of oil was one of the causes of the crises, although the oil income box's law was passed in the parliament, but forming its council and entrusting its members were disabled in the parliament, the reason was the dispute between political parties over their share in mentioned council. | The oil income box should be formed, and its members should be selected and start working. |
| 19. | Neither the parliament nor the bodies that should be independent, were not financially independent, all of them the parliament included are waiting for the ministry of finances to give them their | The parliament and the independent bodies must be financially independent and protected. |

| | | |
|-----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | salaries or allocate a small budget for them. | |
| 20. | The president of the parliament submitted his resignation letter, but it wasn't inserted into the agenda, this was against the rules of procedure. | Violations of rules of procedure must be stopped. |
| 21. | A number of parliamentarians were not going to work, and no procedures were taken against them. | Procedures should be taken against the members that do not go to work or carry out their duties. |
| 22. | Some parties and people were threatening several parliamentarians, to discourage the parliamentarian in carrying out their duties. | Parliamentarians have immunity and they shouldn't be defamed, threaten or attacked, the character of a parliamentarian must be protected. |
| 23. | The role of parliament in the political arena of Kurdistan region was not considered, parliament got marginalized in the important and fateful decisions, although according to resolution No. 1 of the year 2005 the political presidency of Kurdistan must refer to the parliament for the fateful decisions. | The parliament is the highest establishment legally and politically, it should have significant role in fateful matters and it shouldn't be marginalized. |
| 24. | The parliament process was under threat in Kurdistan, it couldn't pass the laws that the executive authority did not approve, and the government dominated the parliament. | The independence of parliament must be protected and the dominance and control of political parties, the government and the actors should be driven away from it. |
| 25. | The democracy in Kurdistan region was in regression, the civil laws that were passed in Kurdistan parliament were violated and hindered and their freedom got limited, e.g. law No. 1 of the year 2011 of non-governmental organizations and law No. 11 of the year 2013 of the right of obtaining information and law No. 5 of the year 2013 of partnership and development charter between the general authorities and non-governmental organizations and many other laws. | Those civil laws that were passed must be implemented as soon as possible. |
| 26. | Although most parliamentarians had positive opinion about the process of monitoring the parliament and had common understanding that the parliament should be monitored by the organizations. But a prevailing mentality prevented this and did not believe in transparency. | The door of parliament must be open for the organizations for the purpose of monitoring the performance of the people's representatives. |
| 27. | The Kurdistan parliament wasn't carrying out its duties in preparing and organizing the record of voters, it wasn't monitoring the performance of commission of elections sufficiently. The government | The parliament should monitor the performance of commission of elections closely, and provide their needs and collaborate for them, if the government and the related parties were not facilitative, the |

| | | |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| | wasn't facilitative and didn't carry out its duty in preparing and organizing the record of voters especially the ministers of commerce, justice, interior, Peshmarga, finance and council of Asaysh. There was no collaboration between the commission and the ministries of health, justice and council of justice to remove the names of the deceased. | parliament should question and take procedures against the government and the related parties. |
| 28. | Sufficient budget was not allocated for the commission and its works. | Sufficient budget should be allocated for the commission. |
| 29. | The budget of the region wasn't sent to the parliament for five years. Not sending the draft budget wasn't related to the financial crisis of not sending the region's budget from Baghdad, because the internal income was available, the government continued to sell oil, but the government didn't send the draft budget to the parliament for five years, this was related to hiding the sources of income and lack of transparency. | The budget of the region should be sent to the parliament in time. |
| 30. | The government didn't send the final accounts to the parliament for five years | Pressure should be put on the government to send the final accounts. |
| 31. | The matter of constitution was worked on and a law was passed for it and a committee was formed for it, but the legal period of the committee ended, and its works suspended, and its time wasn't extended. | The matter of constitution must be resolved, and the committee should be formed again according to the law and start its works. |
| 32. | Issuing a new rules of procedure was a positive work, although there are notes about it, but the parliament stated that when the rules of procedure is passed it will be implemented, but the term ended and only the deputy and the secretary's titles changed to fist deputy and second deputy and no other items implemented, this adjustment is against the law of election because in it the terms of deputy and secretary exist not the first deputy and second deputy, neither the mentioned committees got disbanded or merged, nor the management structure of parliament was identified, etc. | The new rules of procedure must be implemented, and if it had any conflicts with the law, they should be resolved too. |

Table No. 15
Summary of parliament's work in the five years of fourth term
6/Nov/2013 – 6/Nov/2018

| No. | Title | No. |
|-----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------|
| 1 | Number of parliament's sessions | 104 |
| 2 | Number of agenda items | 352 |
| 3 | Number of agenda items/ implemented | 196 |
| 4 | Number of agenda items/ not implemented | 156 |
| 5 | Draft laws that submitted to the presidency of the parliament | 309 |
| 6 | Number of draft laws that had their first read from the start of the parliament. | 213 |
| 7 | Draft laws that weren't read. | 96 |
| 8 | Number of laws passed | 33 |
| 9 | Number of resolutions issued | 8 |
| 10 | Number of council of ministers' members that the parliamentarians requested to attend the parliament hall. | 33 |
| 11 | Number of council of ministers' members that attended the parliament hall upon the request of parliamentarians | 13 |
| 12 | Number of council of ministers' members that the parliamentarians requested to attend the parliament hall, but did not attend. | 20 |
| 13 | Number of council of ministers' members that attended the parliament hall upon the request of themselves | 2 |
| 14 | Number of questioning council of ministers' members | 0 |
| 15 | Number of meetings of committees | 554 |
| 16 | Number of committees' reports that were written on draft laws from the beginning of the parliament until now | 149 |
| 17 | Number of committees' reports that weren't written on the draft laws | 346 |
| 18 | Number of questions of parliamentarians that were asked from the government | 826 |
| 19 | Number of questions of parliamentarians that were answered | 524 |
| 20 | Number of questions of parliamentarians that weren't answered | 302 |
| 21 | Number of absences of members from the meetings (the number of absence of members from the recent meetings couldn't be obtained, this is the old number) | 1183 |

The Pay Institute for Education and Development Publications

First: in Kurdish language:

- 1- خستنه پووێ 101 گهروگرفتی پهروه دهیی له پیناو چاره سه رکردنیان، نامه یه کی کراوه بۆ بهرێزه زیری پهروه ده، هه ولێر، 2014.
- 2- گرفته کانی خویندنی بالۆ گه پان به دوای چاره سه ردا، خستنه رووی (140) گرفت، له نامه یه کی کراوه دا بۆ بهرێزه زیری خویندنی بالۆ، هه ولێر، 2014.
- 3- دیارده ی وازه پینان له خویندن له هه ریمی کوردستاندا، گرفت و چاره سه ر، هه ولێر، 2014.
- 4- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی یه که م، (2013/11/6-2014/11/6)، هه ولێر، 2014.
- 5- کاری هاوبه شی نیوان ریکخواه کانی کۆمه لگه ی مه ده نی و داموده زگه کانی خویندنی بالۆ له هه ریمی کوردستان، هه ولێر، 2015.
- 6- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی دووه م، (2014/9/1-2015/2/28)، هه ولێر، 2015.
- 7- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی سییه م، (2015/3/1-2015/8/31)، هه ولێر، 2015.
- 8- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی چواره م، (2015/9/1-2015/11/12)، سلێمانی، 2015.
- 9- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی پینجه م، (2015/9/1-2016/2/29)، سلێمانی، 2016.
- 10- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی شه شه م، (2016/3/1-2016/8/31)، سلێمانی، 2016.
- 11- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی هه وه م، (2016/9/1-2017/2/28)، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 12- چاودێری کردنی په رله مان له روانگه ی ئەندامانی په رله مانی کوردستانه وه ، راپۆرتی هه شته م، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 13- تۆماری ده نگه رانی هه ریمی کوردستان له نیوان بیگه ردی و ساخته کاریدا ، راپۆرتی تۆیه م، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 14- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی ده یه م، (2017/3/1-2017/11/15)، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 15- رهوشی خویندنی پیشه یی له پارێزگا کانی سلێمانی و هه له بجه، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 16- خویندنی ناحکومی له نیوان کوالیتی و بازرگانیدا، سلێمانی، 2017.
- 17- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی یانزه هه م، (2017/11/6-2018/3/6)، سلێمانی، 2018.
- 18- چاودێری و هه لسه نگاندنی کاره کانی په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی دوانزه هه م، (2018/3/6-2018/11/6)، سلێمانی، 2018.
- 19- پهروه ده له بهرده م ئالنگاری و گرفتی چاره نه کراودا، هه ولێر، 2019.
- 20- خویندنی بالۆ له بهرده م ئالنگاری و گرفتی چاره نه کراودا، هه ولێر، 2019.
- 21- راپۆرتی چاودێری بۆ هه لپژاردنی خولی پینجه می په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی یه که م، ده نگدانی تایبه ت، سلێمانی، 2018.
- 22- راپۆرتی چاودێری بۆ هه لپژاردنی خولی پینجه می په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی دووه م، ده نگدانی گشتی، سلێمانی، 2018.
- 23- هه لسه نگاندنی بۆ کاره کانی خولی چواره می په رله مانی کوردستان، راپۆرتی سیانزه هه م، (2013/11/6-2018/11/6)، سلێمانی، 2019.

Second: in Arabic language

- ١- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الاول، (٢٠١٣/١١/٦-٢٠١٤/١١/٦)، اربيل، ٢٠١٤.
- ٢- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الثاني،(٢٠١٤/٩/١-٢٠١٥/٢/٢٨)، اربيل، ٢٠١٥.
- ٣- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الثالث، (٢٠١٥/٣/١-٢٠١٥/٨/٣١)، اربيل، ٢٠١٥.
- ٤- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الرابع، (٢٠١٥/٩/١-٢٠١٥/١١/١٢)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٥.
- ٥- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الخامس، (٢٠١٥/٩/١-٢٠١٦/٢/٢٩)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٦.
- ٦- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير السادس، (٢٠١٦/٣/١-٢٠١٦/٨/٣١)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٦.
- ٧- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير السابع، (٢٠١٦/٩/١-٢٠١٧/٢/٢٨)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٧.
- ٨- الرقابة علي البرلمان من وجه نظر نواب برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الثامن، السليمانية، ٢٠١٧.
- ٩- سجل الناخبين في اقليم كوردستان بين النقاء والاحتياي ، التقرير التاسع، السليمانية، ٢٠١٧.
- ١٠- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير العاشر، (٢٠١٧/٣/١-٢٠١٧/١١/١٥)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٧.
- ١١- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الحادي عشر، (٢٠١٧/١١/٦-٢٠١٨/٣/٦)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٨.
- ١٢- مراقبة وتقييم اعمال برلمان كوردستان، التقرير الثاني عشر، (٢٠١٨/٣/٦-٢٠١٨/١١/٦)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٨.
- ١٣- تقرير الرقابة على انتخابات الدورة الخامسة لبرلمان كوردستان، التقرير الاول، التصويت الخاص، السليمانية، ٢٠١٨.
- ١٤- تقرير الرقابة على انتخابات الدورة الخامسة لبرلمان كوردستان، التقرير الياني، التصويت العام، السليمانية، ٢٠١٨.
- ١٥- تقييم اعمال الدورة الرابعة لبرلمان كوردستان، التقرير الثلاثة عشر، (٢٠١٣/١١/٦-٢٠١٨/١١/٦)، السليمانية، ٢٠١٩.

Third: In English

- 1- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, The first report, (6/11/2014-6/11/2014), Erbil, 2014.
- 2- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Second report, (1/9/2014-28/2/2015), Erbil, 2015.
- 3- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Third Report, (1/3/2015-31/8/2015), Erbil, 2015.
- 4- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Fourth Report, (1/9/2015-12/11/2015), Sulaymaniyah, 2015.
- 5- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Fifth report, (1/9/2015-29/2/2016), Sulaymaniyah, 2016.
- 6- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Sixth Report, (1/3/2016-31/8/2016), Sulaymaniyah, 2016.
- 7- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Seventh Report, (1/9/2016-28/2/2017), Sulaymaniyah, 2017.
- 8- Monitoring parliament by members in Kurdistan Parliament, Eighth report, Sulaymaniyah, 2017.
- 9- Voters Registration Records between Transparency and Fraud, Ninth Report, Sulaymaniyah, 2017.
- 10- Monitoring parliament by members in Kurdistan Parliament, Tenth report, (1/3/2017-15/11/2017), Sulaymaniyah, 2017.
- 11- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Eleventh report, (6/11/2017-6/3/2018), Sulaymaniyah, 2018.
- 12- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Twelfth report, (6/3/2018-6/11/2018), Sulaymaniyah, 2018.
- 13- Monitoring Report on The Fifth Session of the Parliament of Kurdistan, first report, Sulaymaniyah, 2018.
- 14- Monitoring Report on The Fifth Session of the Parliament of Kurdistan, Second report, Sulaymaniyah, 2018.
- 15- Monitoring and Evaluating, For the Kurdistan Parliaments Work, Thirteenth report, (6/11/2013-6/11/2018), Sulaymaniyah, 2019.

Part of the publications and reports of the PAY Institute for Education and Development





A Brief Account of PAY Institute For Education And Development

PAY Institute has registered by the Non-Governmental Organization Department of the Kurdistan Regional Government in November, 2013. PAY is a Kurdish non-governmental independent, non-seeking profit .

A Summary On The Institutes' projects:

1. A Common Project Among Civil Society Organizations And High Educational Apparatuses In The Kurdistan Regional Government.

This project which the institute carried out and its fund which was provided by the non-governmental organization department and tried to interpret the 2013 mandate number 5 of the Kurdistan parliament on the common agreement and development among general authorities and non-governmental organizations in the region of Kurdistan. This project included four workshops, gathering with the presidents of all universities in Kurdistan regional government and holding a two day conference. The participants signed a partnership agreement about common work and presented some suggestions to the concerning participants. The project longed for a year.

2. The project Of Monitoring The Kurdistan Parliament.

This project includes the monitoring and evaluation of the work of the Parliament of the Kurdistan Region based on (the principle of the development of laws and oversight of public institutions), and that the project publishes semi-annual reports and so far year published (9) reports and art of the project includes a website called (Observatory) (In Kurdish and Arabic) and disseminates information. This project is implemented in cooperation with the National Fund for Democracy Support (NED).

3. The project of Monitoring on the work of the Ministry of Education

This project has published four reports on the work of the Ministry of Education:

first report: A Workshop About The Phenomenon of Studying Abandon In Kurdistan Region

This project included a contribution workshop between both the international cooperation for human value organizations and PAY Institute for Education And Development about lessening and decreasing the range of this phenomenon in the region of Kurdistan which was held on (June 18-19, 2014) in Erbil province, with a number of 120 attendants including the parliament representatives, ministries, organizations and mass media apparatuses. This project like the previous ones fulfilled in a voluntary way.

Second report: The project of Monitoring of Educational Ministry's Works

This project published at (June 25, 2014), it included 101 points report on the problems of education and study in Kurdistan Regional government. With the commencement of the new cabinet of Kurdistan Regional Government, this report was presented to the Minister of education in presence of professors, organization representatives and media apparatuses of the Kurdistan Regional Government.

Third report: contributing to further activating vocational education in the provinces of Sulaimani and Halabja The project was a field project aimed at highlighting the problems facing vocational education and suggested solutions conducted by PAY Institute for Education and Development and Halwest Organization in cooperation with Public Aid Organization (PAO) and Norwegian People Aid (NPA). The project consisted in three workshops, brochure distribution and a research. It was carried out between 1/5/2017 and 1/10/2017.

Fourth report: Private Education between Quality and Business (Problems and solutions) The project consisted in a report prepared on private education in Iraqi Kurdistan and its problems as well as suggested solutions. The study took Sulaimani provincial center as a sample and it was implemented by PAY Institute for Education and Development in cooperation with Norwegian People Aid (NPA) and Reform Institute for Development (RID). The study was completed and carried out between 1/7/2017 to 1/10/2017

Fifth report: Education in face of challenges and unsolved problems

This activity consisted of a conference and publishing an evaluation report on Kurdistan Region's Ministry of Education works and activities during five years of work. The conference covered seven panels delivered by professors and specialists.

Fifth report: Education in face of challenges and unsolved problems

This activity consisted of a conference and publishing an evaluation report on Kurdistan Region's Ministry of Education works and activities during five years of work. The conference covered seven panels delivered by professors and specialists.

4. The Project For Monitoring of Works By Ministry of Higher Education And Scientific Research: This project has, so far, released two reports on the Ministry of Higher Education's activities and duties.

first report: The Challenges of Higher Education and the Search for Solutions, highlighting 140 problems and an open letter to the Minister of Higher Education

This project was delivered on the 22nd of July, 2014 in the presence of the minister of higher education and 80 university professors, delegates and representatives of organizations and media channels. During the session, the minister of higher education decided that the report be sent to all the universities to receive their opinions on the contents of the report and their suggested solutions. He also pledged to follow up the recommendations as well.

Second report: Higher Education in face of challenges and unsolved problems

This activity consisted of a conference and publishing an evaluation report on Kurdistan Region's Ministry of Higher Education works and activities during five years of work. The conference covered seven panels delivered by professors and specialists.

5. The project of monitoring the High Independent Commission for Elections and Referendums:

This project started in July 2017 to cover the referendum process and the elections for Kurdistan parliament on September, 30th, 2018. The project submitted the violations and the threats for the process to the commission in the form of ultimatums. Thus, in November, 2017, it submitted a report titled "The electoral registers between integrity and fraud"; then following Kurdistan parliament's fifth term elections, it submitted two reports on public and special polls.